To: Kathy Glennan, Chair, RDA Steering Committee

Cc: Linda Barnhart, RSC Secretary

From: Damian Iseminger, Technical Team Liaison Officer

Subject: Response to RSC/RSCSecretary/2022/2

The Technical Team Liaison Officer thanks the RSC Secretary for the proposal. Members of the Technical Working Group have several suggestions for improving the recommendations in the proposal. Before moving on to the recommendations themselves, we wish to provide some overall thoughts about rdam:P30050, *note on issue or part or iteration used as basis for identification of manifestation.*

Data provenance

Review of the element indicates that this element is actually describing the provenance of a *metadata work*. In this particular case, the element is describing which unit or iteration is used as the source of the values of *metadata statements* that are selected by the *metadata description set* for the description of a multiunit manifestation.

There are several existing data provenance elements that could be used to describe the provenance of a *metadata description set*:

- Work: *note on metadata work*: A broad unstructured description of one or more attributes of a metadata work.
- Work: *source consulted*: A manifestation in which there is evidence for a metadata work.
- Work: *scope of validity*: An unstructured or structured description of a set of entities for which the value of a metadata work is valid.

Given the above, there are several options for handling revisions for this particular element:

1. Proceed with the revisions to the element as recommended by the RSC Secretary in Recommendations 1 and 2, with any amendments accepted by the RSC, but change the soft deprecation of this element from Manifestation: *note on manifestation* to Work: *note on metadata work,* or Work: *source consulted*, or Work: *scope of validity*
2. Proceed with the revisions to the element as recommended in Recommendations 1 and 2 by the RSC Secretary in Recommendations 1 and 2, with any amendments accepted by the RSC, but add an option to each Condition/Option group to record a value for Work: *note on metadata work,* or Work: *source consulted*, or Work: *scope of validity*
3. Hard deprecation, i.e. removing the element from RDA, and use the existing data provenance elements for indicating the provenance of the *metadata description set*. This option would nullify recommendations 1 and 2.

Given that the intent of the proposal is to standardize language concerning multiunit manifestations, the Technical Working Group realizes that a discussion of hard deprecation of this element may not want to be considered at this time.

For the purposes of this proposal, the TWG has decided to address its comments concerning Recommendations 1 and 2 in the spirit of Option 2. If Option 1 is preferred by the RSC, the option boxes proposed in Option 2 would not be required.

Recommendation 1: For Manifestation: note on issue or part or iteration used as basis for identification of manifestation, amend the text to make implied conditions explicit and remove unnecessary subheadings.

The TWG is in agreement with the recommendation that instances of 'part' should be replaced in the RDA text with 'unit' when referring to a manifestation.

However, there are several observations that we have about other parts of the proposed text that we believe need addressing:

- the term 'issue' should not be used when referring to a manifestation. The term is used as an element name (a work that is a static work that is inspired by the overall editorial policy, scope, and style of a successive aggregating work) and is a work-level element.
- The terms 'issue', 'part' (or an alternative term), or 'iteration' should be retained when referring to a work
    - Successive aggregating works have 'issues'
    - Integrating works have 'iterations'
    - Successive multiple part works have 'parts'
        - The term 'part work' could be used to avoid conflict with 'part' as defined in RDA Format of Notated Music.
- The definition of the element is not confined to manifestations of diachronic works; it may also be used to describe the unit consulted for a manifestation of a static work. Therefore the Conditions/Options should cover all cases.
- The decision on which unit or iteration used as the basis of a description is no longer prescribed in RDA and is intentionally left up to policy choices. Therefore the Conditions/Options should reflect this understanding.

Based on the above, the TWG suggests the following changes to the text proposed in this Recommendation. For the data provenance options, we have left the choice of element (Work: *note on metadata work*, Work: *source consulted*, Work: *scope of validity*) up to the RSC.

Marked-Up Version (based on Clean proposed text)

CONDITION
A manifestation consists of two or more ~~issues or~~ units.
~~A manifestation embodies a successive determinate work or a serial work.~~
~~The identification of a manifestation is not based on the first released issue or unit (see Resource description. Describing a manifestation).~~

> OPTION
> Record a note identifying the ~~issue or~~ unit ~~used as the basis for the identification~~ <u>consulted in preparing the base description of the manifestation</u>.

OPTION
Record a Work: [data provenance element] identifying the unit consulted in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

CONDITION
A manifestation consists of two or more numbered ~~issues or~~ units.
~~A manifestation embodies a serial work.~~
Two or more ~~issues or~~ units have been consulted in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

OPTION
~~Record a separate note identifying the latest issue or unit consulted in preparing the description.~~

OPTION
Record separate notes identifying the units consulted.

OPTION
Record a Work: [data provenance element] identifying the range of units consulted.

OPTION
~~Do not make a note of earliest or latest issues or units consulted if they are the same as those recorded in Manifestation: numbering of sequence.~~
[NB: The TWG feels that this is a policy decision and is covered by the Option proposed by the TWG to record a note identifying the units consulted]

~~CONDITION~~
~~A manifestation consists of two or more unnumbered issues or units.~~
~~A manifestation embodies a serial work.~~

~~OPTION~~
~~Record a note identifying the earliest issue or unit consulted and its date of publication.~~
[NB: The TWG feels that this is a policy decision]

~~CONDITION~~
~~A manifestation consists of two or more unnumbered issues or units.~~
~~A manifestation embodies a serial work.~~
~~Issues or units other than the earliest have been consulted.~~

~~OPTION~~
~~Record a separate note identifying the latest issue or unit consulted and its date.~~
[NB: The TWG feels that this is a policy decision]

~~CONDITION~~
~~A manifestation consists of two or more units.~~

A manifestation embodies a successive determinate work.

> OPTION
> Record a note identifying the unit on which the identification of the manifestation is based or its number
> or publication date, as appropriate.
> [NB: Covered by the generalization of the 1st Condition/Option]

CONDITION
A manifestation consists of two or more units.
A manifestation embodies a successive determinate work.
Two or more parts have been consulted.

> OPTION
> Record a separate note identifying the latest unit consulted in making the description.
> [NB: Covered by the generalization of the 1st Condition/Option]

CONDITION
A manifestation embodies an integrating work.

> OPTION
> Record a note identifying the latest iteration consulted in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

> OPTION
> Record a Work: [data provenance element] identifying the iteration consulted in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

CONDITION
A manifestation is an online resource.

> OPTION
> Record a note identifying the date on which the manifestation was viewed for description in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

> OPTION
> Record a Work: [data provenance element] identifying the date on which the manifestation was viewed in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

Clean copy

CONDITION
A manifestation consists of two or more units.

> OPTION

Record a note identifying the unit consulted in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

OPTION

Record a Work: [data provenance element] identifying the unit consulted in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

CONDITION

A manifestation consists of two or more numbered units.
Two or more units have been consulted in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

OPTION

Record separate notes identifying the units consulted.

OPTION

Record a Work: [data provenance element] identifying the range of units consulted.

CONDITION

A manifestation embodies an integrating work.

OPTION

Record a note identifying the iteration consulted in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

OPTION

Record a Work: [data provenance element] identifying the iteration consulted in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

CONDITION

A manifestation is an online resource.

OPTION

Record a note identifying the date on which the manifestation was viewed in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

OPTION

Record a Work: [data provenance element] identifying the date on which the manifestation was viewed in preparing the base description of the manifestation.

Recommendation 2: For Manifestation: note on issue or part or iteration used as basis for identification of manifestation, change the element label to note on issue or unit or iteration used as basis for identification of manifestation, add an alternate label, and adjust the definition.

The TWG suggests that instances of the word 'issue' should be eliminated from the term and the definition due to the use of the term to refer to a work-level element.

Marked-up version (based on proposed text)

Manifestation: note on ~~issue or~~ unit or iteration used as basis for identification of manifestation

Definition and Scope
A note that identifies ~~an issue,~~ <u>a</u> unit or iteration that is used for the base description of a multiple unit or integrating manifestation.

Clean version

Manifestation: note on unit or iteration used as basis for identification of manifestation

Definition and Scope
A note that identifies a unit or iteration that is used for the base description of a multiple unit or integrating manifestation.

Recommendation 3: For Manifestation: note on numbering of sequence, amend the text in five places to correct the terms "serial" and "part."

Because the definition indicates that it can apply to both multiple unit manifestation or a manifestation of an integrating work, the TWG suggests the following changes to the text of the element. The text is based on the clean version of the recommendation.

Marked-up version (based on proposed text)

Definition and Scope

A note on manifestation that provides information on the range of designators that is used to indicate a sequence of the individual ~~parts~~ units or iterations of a manifestation.

Recording an unstructured description

OPTION
Record details or other unstructured information.

OPTION
Record a note giving the numbering of the first ~~issue or unit~~ unit or iteration and/or of the last ~~issue or unit~~ unit or iteration if this information is not recorded as part of Manifestation: numbering of sequence.

CONDITION
Information about numbering errors, or complex or irregular numbering of a sequence is not already specified in a value of Manifestation: numbering of sequence.

OPTION
Record notes on numbering errors, or complex or irregular numbering of a manifestation of a ~~serial work~~ multiple unit manifestation or manifestation of an integrating work.

CONDITION
A manifestation of a serial work is issued annually or less frequently.
The period covered by the volume, etc., is other than a calendar *year*.

OPTION
Record a note on the period covered by a manifestation of a serial work.

Clean version

Definition and Scope

A note on manifestation that provides information on the range of designators that is used to indicate a sequence of the individual units or iterations of a manifestation.

Recording an unstructured description

OPTION

Record details or other unstructured information.

OPTION

Record a note giving the numbering of the first unit or iteration and/or of the last unit or iteration if this information is not recorded as part of Manifestation: numbering of sequence.

CONDITION

Information about numbering errors, or complex or irregular numbering of a sequence is not already specified in a value of Manifestation: numbering of sequence.

OPTION

Record notes on numbering errors, or complex or irregular numbering of a manifestation of a multiple unit manifestation or manifestation of an integrating work.

CONDITION

A manifestation of a serial work is issued annually or less frequently.
The period covered by the volume, etc., is other than a calendar *year*.

OPTION

Record a note on the period covered by a manifestation of a serial work.

Recommendation 4: For Manifestation: note on statement of responsibility, amend the text to make implied conditions explicit and remove unnecessary subheadings.

The TWG suggests the following changes to the recommendation so that the first unit received is not privileged:

Marked-up version (based on proposed text)

Changes in statement of responsibility

CONDITION
A manifestation consists of two or more units.
A manifestation embodies a static work or a successive determinate work.

> OPTION
> Record notes on differences in statements of responsibility that occur on ~~a subsequent unit~~ <u>different units</u>, if considered important for identification or access.

CONDITION
A manifestation consists of two or more units.
A manifestation embodies a serial work.

> OPTION
> Record notes on changes in statements of responsibility that occur ~~after the first/earliest issue or unit~~ <u>on different units</u>, if considered important for identification or access.

CONDITION
A manifestation embodies a serial work.
Changes have been numerous.

> OPTION
> Record a general note.

CONDITION
A manifestation embodies an integrating work.

> OPTION
> Record notes on statements of responsibility no longer present on the current iteration of a manifestation of an integrating work or that appeared in a different form on earlier iterations, if considered important for identification or access.

CONDITION
A manifestation embodies an integrating work.
Changes have been numerous.

> OPTION

Record a general note.

OPTION
Record details or other unstructured information.

Clean version:

Changes in statement of responsibility

CONDITION
A manifestation consists of two or more units.
A manifestation embodies a static work or a successive determinate work.

OPTION
Record notes on differences in statements of responsibility that occur on different units, if considered important for identification or access.

CONDITION
A manifestation consists of two or more units.
A manifestation embodies a serial work.

OPTION
Record notes on changes in statements of responsibility that occur on different units, if considered important for identification or access.

CONDITION
A manifestation embodies a serial work.
Changes have been numerous.

OPTION
Record a general note.

CONDITION
A manifestation embodies an integrating work.

OPTION
Record notes on statements of responsibility no longer present on the current iteration of a manifestation of an integrating work or that appeared in a different form on earlier iterations, if considered important for identification or access.

CONDITION
A manifestation embodies an integrating work.
Changes have been numerous.

OPTION
Record a general note.

OPTION
Record details or other unstructured information.

Recommendation 5: For Manifestation: title proper, amend the text to correct the term "serial."

Amend the proposal to remove 'issues' from the 7th bullet point:

Marked-up version (based on proposed text)

- two or more titles proper used on different ~~issues~~ <u>units</u> of a manifestation of a serial work in a regular pattern

Clean version

- two or more titles proper used on different units of a manifestation of a serial work in a regular pattern

Recommendation 6: For Work: creator person of work, amend the text to correct the term "serial" and move the entire subsection to Prerecording.

The TWG agrees with the recommendation, but since a serial work is by definition an aggregating work, it may be better to replace instances of 'a creator' with 'an aggregator', where applicable.

Recommendation 7: For Work: creator family of work, amend the text to correct the term "serial."

The TWG agrees with the recommendation, but since a serial work is by definition an aggregating work, it may be better to replace instances of 'a creator' with 'an aggregator', where applicable.

Recommendation 8: For Work: frequency, amend the text to correct the terms "serial" and "part."

This element covers all diachronic works, not just serial works or integrating works, so the Option could be broadened. We do not agree that 'units' should be substituted for 'parts'. The term 'unit' should only be used when describing a manifestation; the term 'part works' could be used instead to indicate the discrete component of a serial work.

Marked-up version (based on proposed text)

OPTION
Record a *frequency* of the release of issues or ~~units~~ <u>part works</u> of a ~~serial~~ <u>successive</u> work or the frequency of updates to an integrating work.

Clean version

OPTION
Record a *frequency* of the release of issues or part works of a successive work or the frequency of updates to an integrating work.

If this amendment is accepted, it may also be prudent to revise the definition of this element, changing 'part' to 'part work'.

Recommendation 9: Add "Use for" references from "serial" (and variants of that term) to "multiple unit" to provide guidance to those looking for "serial" as a mode of issuance.

There was disagreement among members of the Technical Working Group concerning the necessity of UF term 'multiple unit serial' pointing to 'serial work', as a serial is always a multiple unit manifestation.