

MINUTES
JANUARY 2024 RSC MEETING
Asynchronous, via Basecamp and Zoom
29 January – 1 February 2024

- Attending: Colleen Barbus, RDA Board Chair
Renate Behrens, RSC Chair
Charlene Chou, RSC Wider Community Engagement Officer
Charlotte Christensen, RSC Oceania representative
Ahava Cohen, RSC Europe representative
Szabolcs Dancs, RSC Translations Team Liaison Officer
Jessica Grzegorski, RDA Examples Editor
James Hennelly, Director, ALA Digital Reference (RDA publisher)
Damian Iseminger, RSC Technical Team Liaison Officer
Robert Maxwell, RSC North America representative
Elisa Sze, RSC Education and Orientation Officer
Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary
- Apologies: Szabolcs Dancs was unable to attend the Public Session on 30 January.
- Observers: Jack Ennis-Butler (Backup Oceania Representative)
Honor Moody (Outgoing RDA Examples Editor)
Melanie Polutta (Backup North America Representative)
- Observers (Public Session on 30 January only):
Thomas Brenndorfer (Chair of the Extent Working Group), Canada
Erica Chang, USA
kalan Knudson Davis, USA
Bonnie Dede, USA
Britannia Gammond, Canada
Kathy Glennan, USA
John Hostage, USA
Sarah Hovde, USA
Bridget Jennings, New Zealand
Ed Jones, USA
Shawn King, USA
Roger Kohn, USA
Olivera Nastic, Serbia
Daniel Paradis (member of the Official Languages Working Group), Canada
Alice Robinson-Baker, Switzerland

Amanda Sprochi, USA

I-Chene Tai (member of the Examples Working Group), USA

Pamela Thomas, USA

Jenny Wright, UK

Thurstan Young, UK

Item numbering continues from the previous meeting.

CONTENTS

Executive Session

444 Welcome, catching up and review of past action items

445 Operations documents

446 Working Groups

447 Orientation package for new RSC members

448 Fast Tracks

449 Impact statements in proposals

Public Session

444 Welcome

450 Annual Report

451 Action Plan

452 Update from ALA Digital Reference

453 Update on Working Groups

454 Update from Regional Representatives and Wider Community Engagement Officer

455 AOB (Any Other Business) and Thanks from the Chair

Executive Session

444 Welcome, catching up and review of past action items

444.1 Welcome

RSC Chair Renate Behrens opened both the Executive Session on 29 January and the Public Session on 30 January by offering a warm welcome. In the Public Session, she passed on apologies from Szabolcs Dancs, the Translations Team Liaison Officer, and asked each member of the RSC to introduce themselves, then outlined the way that the meeting would be structured. For each topic, she would ask RSC members for comments first and then open to observers, from whom she warmly welcomed questions and comments.

444.2 Review of past action items

All actions from the previous meeting have been completed or are in progress.

445 Operations documents

445.1 RSC/Operations/4/2024

Past Chair Kathy Glennan had submitted the draft update to Operations/4 to which she had committed in October ([RSC/Minutes/423-443](#) Item 439.4.1). Following discussion on Impact Statements in proposals ([Item 449](#)), the RSC Secretary was tasked with adding an instruction on impact statements, and she submitted an updated draft on 31 January. Following a vote, both Kathy Glennan's updates and the new instruction on impact statements were approved.

445.1.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to publish RSC/Operations/4/2024.

445.2 RSC/Operations/5/2024

At the RSC Meeting in October, RDA Examples Editor Honor Moody asked that consultation with the Examples Working Group be added to the charge documents for the other Working Groups ([RSC/Minutes/423-443](#) Item 419.7.1). The Secretary reported that upon closer reading, it became clear that the charge documents direct Working Groups to RSC/Operations/5 and the instruction to consult the Technical Working Group is given there. A draft of RSC/Operations/5/2024 was submitted by the Secretary which included the instruction Honor Moody requested. Following discussion on Impact Statements in proposals ([Item 449](#)), the RSC Secretary was tasked with adding an instruction on impact statements to the sections on discussion papers and proposals, and she submitted an updated draft on 31 January. Following a vote, both the instruction suggested by Honor Moody and the new instructions on impact statements were approved.

445.2.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to publish RSC/Operations/5/2024.

445.3 RSC/Operations/1

The Secretary highlighted that per [RSC/Minutes/423-443](#) Item 439.5.1 she had published the update to RSC/Operations/1 ([website](#) | [repository](#)) covering the Education and Orientation Officer role's being made permanent.

446 Working Groups

Renate Behrens reported that she had been in touch with all the Working Groups and provided a brief update on each, later repeated in the Public Session ([Item 453](#)). She had asked the Secretary to prepare updated charge documents (as outlined below ([Item 446.1.2](#) ; [446.2.3](#) ; [446.3.1](#) ; [446.4.1](#))), and asked voting members of the RSC to approve them ahead of the Public Session.

446.1 Task and Finish Working Groups

446.1.1 Voting members of the RSC approved the decision that the Place/Jurisdiction Working Group and the Official Languages Working Group should be considered to have completed their tasks and be formally closed with thanks.

446.1.2 Voting members of the RSC approved the charge documents to continue the Extent Working Group and the Religions in RDA Working Group. The Secretary published [RSC/Chair/2024/3 – Extent Working Group, 2024](#) and [RSC/Chair/2024/4 – Religions in RDA Working Group, 2024](#) ahead of the Public Session¹.

446.1.3 Renate Behrens reminded the RSC that we are only able to set up a limited number of Task and Finish Working Groups at any one time. With the two continuing groups and the new Joint RDA Board and RSC Working Group on Artificial Intelligence ([Item 446.5](#)), we have capacity to establish one more in 2024.

446.1.3.1 **ACTION ITEM:** Chair and Secretary to add new Task-and-Finish Working Group to Agenda for April RSC Meeting.

446.1.4 Charlotte Christensen asked for clarification on consultation for the proposal ORDAC currently has in preparation. Damian Iseminger confirmed that the Technical Working Group would, as is usual for all proposals, check that it is aligned with LRM and then it will be circulated via the Regional Representatives to their constituencies (from which all

¹ Archived to ALAIR on 2 February 2024: [RSC/Chair/2024/3](#) ; [RSC/Chair/2024/4](#)

current and former Working Group members are drawn). He also pointed out that if ORDAC has any unresolved questions or concerns ahead of their proposal submission, they can submit a Discussion Paper, which would then follow the same order for consultation.

446.2 Examples Working Group

New RDA Examples Editor Jessica Grzegorski provided a brief update.

446.2.1 As one of her last acts as outgoing Examples Editor, Honor Moody completed the finishing touches to RSC/ExamplesEditor/2023/1 ([website](#) | [ALAIR](#)).

446.2.2 The Examples Working Group met for the first time this year on 22 January and plans to meet monthly (online).

446.2.3 The charge document has been updated with Jessica Grzegorski as Chair, Honor Moody as a member, and the addition of two new members, I-Chene Thai and Mélanie Roche. [RSC/Chair/2024/2 – Examples Working Group, 2024](#) was approved by voting members of the RSC and published by the Secretary ahead of the Public Session on 30 January².

446.3 Technical Working Group

Technical Team Liaison Officer Damian Iseminger provided a brief update on the Group's actions since the RSC Meeting in Vienna. In particular, he highlighted the updates to RDA Reference in support of the January release of the RDA Toolkit, and their work on the Guidance Chapter for Data Provenance, based on the changes approved by the RSC during the addition of the Collections Model to RDA. The group expects to start work on Guidance for Collection Description shortly.

446.3.1 The appointment of a new Examples Editor necessitated a small editorial update to the Group's charge document. [RSC/Chair/2024/5 – Technical Working Group, 2024](#) was published ahead of the Public Session on 30 January 2024³.

446.4 Translations Working Group

Translations Team Liaison Officer Szabolcs Dancs provided a brief update. He highlighted the upcoming translators' meeting about the new Examples Working Group (organised in conjunction with Jessica Grzegorski); planned outreach activities; and the newly-available Catalan version of RDA FAQ, [Preguntes Freqüents](#). RDA FAQ is also available in English ([RDA Frequently Asked Questions](#)), French ([Foire aux questions sur](#)

² [Archived to ALAIR](#) on 2 February 2024.

³ [Archived to ALAIR](#) on 2 February 2024.

[RDA](#)), German ([Häufig gestellte Fragen zum Standard Resource Description and Access \(RDA\)](#)), and Hungarian ([Gyakran feltett kérdések](#)).

446.4.1 The appointment of a new Examples Editor necessitated a small editorial update to the Group’s charge document. [RSC/Chair/2024/6 – Translations Working Group, 2024](#) was published ahead of the Public Session on 30 January 2024⁴.

446.5 Establishment of Joint RDA Board and RSC Working Group on Artificial Intelligence

Renate Behrens shared that the Board has asked the RSC to set up a Joint Working Group on Artificial Intelligence. There was a wide-ranging discussion on the topic. Charlene Chou (who also serves on the [PCC Task Group on Strategic Planning for AI and Machine Learning](#)) and Ahava Cohen (who manages staff responsible for AI projects at the National Library of Israel) volunteered to serve alongside Renate Behrens as the RSC members, and Renate Behrens and Chair of the RDA Board Colleen Barbus were happy to accept their offers.

446.5.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary and Chair to draft RSC/Chair/2024/7 – Joint RDA Board and RSC Working Group on Artificial Intelligence for submission to the RDA Board Chair, copying RSC, ahead of the next RDA Board meeting.

447 Orientation package for new RSC members

There was some discussion of the materials that have been drafted so far.

447.1 ACTION ITEM: Members who have not yet recorded their 3-minute videos (for internal RSC use only) to do so ahead of the April meeting.

447.2 ACTION ITEM: Secretary and Chair to add Orientation package to agenda for April meeting.

448 Fast Tracks

Three Fast Track proposals left by the former RSC Translations Team Liaison Officer and RSC Secretary were discussed and decisions reached on them.

448.1 FT2024-01: Definition for “printer agent of”, etc.

Discussion was wide-ranging, beyond the scope of the proposal itself. When it came to voting, the Secretary asked the 4 Yes/No questions required in the Fast Track itself and also whether the RSC would like a further Fast Track to be prepared for the other issue

⁴ [Archived to ALAIR](#) on 2 February 2024.

they had raised in their discussion. The vote was unanimous for the changes from FT2024-01 to be made and for the further Fast Track to be prepared.

448.1.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to prepare FT2024-01/Decisions and update Fast Track spreadsheet.

448.1.2 ACTION ITEM: Technical Team Liaison Officer to implement FT2024-01/Decisions

448.1.3 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to prepare FT2024-04: Definition for “printer agent of”, etc. and “content from type or plates”.

448.2 FT2024-02: Definition for “issuing agent of”, etc.

After extensive discussion, it became clear that a full review of this element by the Technical Working Group is needed. The Translations Team Liaison Officer, therefore, withdrew the Fast Track proposal.

448.2.1 ACTION ITEM: Technical Working Group to review “issuing agent of”, etc. and present the RSC with a proposal, Fast Track proposal, or Discussion Paper as they see most appropriate.

448.3 FT2024-03: Ordinal numbers

In the course of the discussion, the Technical Team Liaison Officer proposed a simpler form of wording than had been left behind by the previous RSC Secretary. When it came to voting, the Secretary therefore posed the two questions from the Fast Track itself and a third question based on the Technical Team Liaison Officer’s wording. RSC members voted unanimously for the wording proposed by the Technical Team Liaison Officer.

448.2.2 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to prepare and implement FT2024-03/Decisions.

449 Impact statements in proposals

Following Ahava Cohen’s query during the October Meeting ([RSC/Minutes/413-443](#) Item 418), Renate Behrens led a discussion on impact statements. Before the 3R Projects, there were four mandatory sections:

- Impact on users
- Impact on cataloguers
- Impact on legacy data
- Impact on RDA

Renate Behrens reported that some discussion papers and proposals recorded “no impact” under some of the headings, but the point was that each of these categories had to be considered. After discussion, the RSC voted to reinstate this requirement.

- 449.1** **ACTION ITEM:** Secretary to update Operations/4 and Operations/5 on 31 January so that voting members of the RSC could approve the changes. This action was completed. See Items [445.1](#) and [445.2](#) for the approval of the updates.

Public Session

29 January, 9-11pm Central European Time, via Zoom

The meeting opened with a warm welcome from RSC Chair Renate Behrens (see [Item 444.1](#)).

450 **Annual Report**

Renate Behrens informed the meeting that the RSC had approved its Annual Report earlier in the day, shared the link to [RSC/Annual Report/2023 on the website](#), and drew their attention to some of its highlights. In particular, she emphasized the ongoing importance of balancing internationalization and the needs of local communities. She drew attention to the countdown clock, which will start in May 2026 and run until May 2027, after which time although the text of Original RDA will be archived, it will not be available as a live product. Finally, she encouraged observers and other members of the wider RDA cataloguing community to be aware that Working Groups are often open for new members. For example, the new Examples Working Group is keen to recruit new members, and those with experience generating examples (perhaps for training colleagues in their local environment) can get in touch with RDA Examples Editor Jessica Grzegorski in the first instance. (Contact details are available on [the RSC Members page](#)).

- 450.1** Observers asked for more information about the countdown clock. In answer to a question, the Director of ALA Digital Reference confirmed that in 2027 the Original RDA Toolkit will be archived and that this would change its links. He explained that archiving was carried out under the aegis of the ALA Institutional Repository (ALAIR) and assured the community that, as publisher, he will keep the community informed of the archiving plan. As a minimum, he can promise that pdfs of the text will remain available, but as 2027 approaches, he will find out more details about the archiving plan and will share it as and when he can. Renate Behrens emphasised that the reason for the countdown clock was that many national and large academic libraries had shared that without a definite date that Original RDA would no longer be available as a full online product it was difficult or even impossible to gain approval from their senior managers to make the move to Official RDA. The countdown clock is not intended as a ‘threat’ to the wider community, but a tool and a deadline to help them prepare.

450.2 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to archive RSC/Annual Report/2023 on ALAIR⁵.

451 Action Plan

The RSC approved its Action Plan 2024-2026 [RSC/Chair/2024/1](#) on 29 January. At the suggestion of the Chair and Secretary, it has a new format, such that it includes the standing tasks followed by one section of tasks with projected completion dates. It includes the year(s) in which tasks will be undertaken. Renate Behrens shared [RSC/Chair/2024/1](#) with the meeting and asked for questions and comments.

451.1 In response to a question about Action Plan item 1g (“Continue to monitor use of soft deprecated elements (2024-2026)”), Technical Team Liaison Officer Damian Iseminger assured the community that no decisions will be made to fully deprecate the terms without further consultation. He will follow-up with responders to the 2023 survey and, again, thanked all those who took time to complete the survey.

451.2 Following on from a presentation Renate Behrens had given in 2023 about ISBD for Manifestation (ISBDM), and the recent news that ISBDM is now in its expert review phase, a question was asked about implementation scenarios. There was some concern that ISBDM will not accommodate flat files and that this may cause issues for compatibility between it and RDA. Renate Behrens thanked the community for raising this concern. She highlighted that ISBD is an IFLA standard. However, she and three other members of the RSC will be attending the Expert Review Meetings. Damian Iseminger highlighted the protocol between IFLA and the RSC and that in practice this meant that any alignment would likely be a mapping, which would be used to achieve a shared understanding between the ISBD Review Group and the RSC. Renate Behrens also highlighted that ISBDM is a pilot. It will be the first IFLA Standard published as an online tool, and so there will be many questions to be answered around this. For information, there will be a webinar organized by the ISBD Review Group for the world-wide community on 25 April 2024 (See ‘Plans for ISBD for Manifestation: July 2023 to July 2024, [IFLA Standards Newsletter, 1\(2\), December 2023](#)).

452 Update from ALA Digital Reference

As well as its usual work publishing the RDA Toolkit ([Item 452.1](#)), ALA Digital Reference has been involved in typesetting and design for the new handout for LIS Educators and Trainers developed by RSC Education and Orientation Officer Elisa Sze ([Item 452.2](#)).

452.1 Update from the Director of ALA Digital Reference

James Hennelly shared that the RDA Toolkit has been growing. The current release includes updates to base RDA and also updates to the Norwegian, Finnish and French translations. It includes the usual range of Policy Statements, plus those from the

⁵ [Archived to ALAIR](#) on 2 February 2024.

National Library of New Zealand, and Library and Archives Canada / Bibliothèque et Archives Canada. The latter means that dual language display has been innovated in the Toolkit. The March Release will include the new version of Community Resources. He has also been busy working on the redesign of <http://rda-rsc.org>, which is projected to take place later this Spring. Finally, he highlighted work underway with the RDA Examples Editor to allow examples to be pulled into base RDA at a quicker speed.

452.2 Update on the Handout for LIS Educators and Trainers

Elisa Sze provided the meeting with a preview of the handout she has been developing for LIS Educators and Trainers. The 6-page handout is not quite ready for publication because it has a few typographic wrinkles to be ironed out, but it will be published on the RSC website soon. It is based on conversations over the last two years with educators and responds to their stated needs for a handout focusing on high level concepts to use as a checklist of areas one may need to consider when teaching RDA. Elisa is open to further comments from anyone involved in education and training in RDA. (Contact details are available on [the RSC Members page](#)).

453 Update on Working Groups

453.1 Task-and-Finish Working Groups

Renate Behrens shared information about the closure of the Official Languages Working Group and the Place/Jurisdiction Working Group and the extension of term to the Extent Working Group and Religions in RDA Working Group (see [Item 446.1](#)).

453.2 Translations Working Group

Translations Team Liaison Officer Szabolcs Dancs had sent apologies for the Public Session, so Renate Behrens shared his news (see [Item 446.4](#)). She shared the progress made on the Arabic translation, on which ALA Digital Reference are now working for inclusion in 2024 Toolkit releases, and the upcoming Translators' Meeting in May 2024 at the EURIG Annual Meeting (see [Item 454.1](#) for dates).

453.3 Technical Working Group

Technical Team Liaison Officer Damian Iseminger shared the Group's activities (see [Item 446.3](#)). He also called for interested observers to get in touch with him, as there is space in the Working Group for new members. With that in mind, he highlighted the main tasks undertaken by the Technical Working Group:

- ensuring the semantic integrity of RDA
- checking conformance with the IFLA-LRM
- updating the Registry (Technical Team Liaison Officer)
- updating Guidance as needed (currently the data provenance guidance and collections guidance).

You can find out more in the Group's charge document (RSC/Chair/2024/5: [website](#) | [repository](#)). He said that experience shows that the best results come from people with "a

foot in both camps” of Cataloguing and Systems and some Working Group members are more experienced in one than the other. In response to a query from an observer about the need to be familiar with GitHub, Damian Iseminger replied that you don’t need to be a GitHub expert, because the Technical Team Liaison Officer is responsible for that, but it’s useful to have an understanding of versioning. He’s happy to be in touch with anyone with a potential interest, since the important thing is to have a range of technical skills across the Working Group as a whole. (Contact details are available on [the RSC Members page](#)). Renate Behrens suggested that we issue a call for new members, since it’s been a while since we have done so for this particular group.

453.3.1 ACTION ITEM: Chair, Technical Working Group and Secretary to draft call for new TWG members.

453.4 Examples Working Group

RDA Examples Editor Jessica Grzegorski shared the new group’s activities (see [Item 446.2](#)), and highlighted that she is happy to hear from potential new members. [The call for interest issued in June](#) is still valid, though you can contact the RDA Examples Editor directly rather than the RSC Chair. (Contact details are available on [the RSC Members page](#)).

454 Update from Regional Representatives and Wider Community Engagement Officer

454.1 Europe Representative

Ahava Cohen shared that the EURIG Annual Meeting will take place in Finland on 15-16 May.

454.2 Oceania Representative

Charlotte Christensen shared that a proposal is in development on dual language names. At the moment it is on track for submission for the April RSC Meeting. After that, she and the rest of ORDAC will be working on a discussion paper on Agent and Place entities from an indigenous and First Nations perspective.

454.3 North America Representative

Robert Maxwell highlighted the NARDAC Forum and stressed that it is open to everyone, not just those resident in North America. He also shared the following North American news that is not under the aegis of NARDAC but in which he and other NARDAC members are participating and which may be of interest to the wider RDA community:

- The Program for Cooperative Cataloging is creating metadata guidance documentation for the string encoding scheme instructions that have been removed from Base RDA and moved to Community Resources. This is ongoing. Four NARDAC members are participating in creation of this documentation.

- The PCC conducted a test of Official RDA several months ago and gathered thousands of comments. One outcome was a spreadsheet of recommendations for RDA which PCC presented to NARDAC. We reviewed the spreadsheet and returned it with recommendations for where the feedback should go (e.g., formal proposals; feedback to ALA (typos, etc.), etc.)
- NARDAC is discussing and planning for programming at ALA Annual in San Diego, California at the end of June/beginning of July. Some of this programming may be in association with the RDA Board, which is meeting in San Diego immediately before the conference.
- The PCC RDA Implementation Task Group has begun its work, which will include speaking to the "rolling implementation" of Official RDA (2024-2027) announced by PCC, survey membership as to when and how they intend to implement, and provide more specific information to membership about implementation than has been provided to date.
- PCC also has constituted the following RDA-related task groups or committees: TG for Official RDA Training (which published the first part of its training materials a few months ago); the RDA Communications Committee; and the TG on Evaluation Guidelines for Non-Latin Script References in NACO Authority Records.

454.4 Wider Community Engagement Officer

Charlene Chou echoed Robert Maxwell's point that activities organised by Regions are open to those outside the organising Region, before giving an overview of her role and calling for anyone from any area outside North America, Europe or Oceania to get in touch with her in the first instance. (Contact details are available on [the RSC Members page](#)).

455 AOB (Any Other Business) and Thanks from the Chair

455.1 There was no further business raised in the Public Session, and Renate Behrens thanked everyone for attending and contributing, particularly observers, and particularly those attending outside normal business hours in their time zone.

455.2 In the Executive Session, Education and Orientation Officer Elisa Sze raised a query about aggregating resources, which Technical Team Liaison Officer Damian Iseminger said he would look into.

455.2.1 ACTION ITEM: Technical Team Liaison Officer to respond to query.

455.2.2 ACTION ITEM: Secretary and Chair to add aggregating resources to the agenda of the October Meeting.

455.3 The Secretary had used Basecamp's to do function to set up individual to do items for voting members of the RSC. The Chair and Secretary felt that this had enabled the ratification of documents smoothly so they could be published ahead of the Public Session. The Secretary asked RSC members for feedback on how useful or otherwise they had found this process. The members who replied said they had found it very useful, and asked for them to be used in future.

455.4 Renate Behrens closed the meeting with thanks to RSC members for their active participation and contributions. She thanked the Secretary for preparing the papers and keeping discussions on track. She and the Secretary promised to be in touch very soon with the updated Action Items Spreadsheet, to dos, and draft Minutes.

Approved by the RDA Steering Committee
16 February 2024.