MINUTES
JULY 2023 MEETING
Asynchronous, via Basecamp and Zoom
10-13 July and 2 August 2023

Attending: Renate Behrens, RSC Chair
Charlene Chou, RSC Wider Community Engagement Officer
Charlotte Christensen, RSC Oceania representative
Ahava Cohen, RSC Europe representative
Szabolcs Dancs, RSC Translations Team Liaison Officer (10-13 July only)
Jack Ennis Butler, Backup RSC Oceania representative (observing)
Kathy Glennan, RSC Past Chair
James Hennelly, Director, ALA Digital Reference (RDA publisher)
Damian Iseminger, RSC Technical Team Liaison Officer
Robert Maxwell, RSC North America representative
Honor Moody, RDA Examples Editor
Elisa Sze, RSC Education and Orientation Officer
John Trevor-Allen, RDA Board Chair
Anne Welsh, RSC Secretary

Apologies: Szabolcs Dancs, RSC Translations Team Liaison Officer (2 August)

Invited participant on 2 August: Pat Riva, Secretary, IFLA Advisory Committee on Standards

Observers on 2 August:
Mikolaj Baj, Ulverscroft, UK
Nicole Becwar, Colorado School of Mines, USA
Thomas Brenndorfer, Guelph Public Library, Canada
Gordon Dunsire, UK
LeChele Gishi, Church History Library, The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, USA
Jessica Grzegorski, Newberry Library, USA
Sarah Hovde, University of Maryland Libraries, USA
Bridget Jennings, Kaunihera o Pōneke | Wellington City Council, New Zealand
Joanna Katsune, Rhode Island Historical Society, USA
Timothy Ryan Mendenhall, Columbia University Libraries, USA
Shawne Miksa, College of Information, University of North Texas, USA

Olivera Nastić, Belgrade City Library, Serbia
Daniel Paradis, Bibliothèque et Archives nationales du Québec, Canada
Hanoch Roniger, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Israel
David Roth, National Library of Israel, Israel
Peter Schouten, Ingressus, the Netherlands
Pamela Thomas, Illinois Heartland Library System, USA
Jenny Wright, BDS, UK

Agenda item numbering continues from the previous meeting.

Table of Contents

Executive Session

Note: The asynchronous executive session of this meeting opened at 8 am, New Zealand Daylight Time (UTC+13) on Monday 10 July. It closed at 6 pm, Mountain Standard Time (UTC-7) on Thursday 13 July.

393 **Catching up and review of past action items.** All action items from May and earlier meetings have either been completed or are in progress.

394 **Update on RDA Board Strategic Plan.** The latest version of the Board's Strategic Plan was shared.

395 **Update on Action Plan**
Current plan: RSC/Chair/2023/1
Changes to the DRAFT Action Plan for the extension of the Education and Orientation Officer role to a permanent position were approved (Item 398.1) and the changes needed to align with the updated Terms of Reference for the RDA Examples Editor were discussed (Item 397), but the other items that were planned for discussion were carried over to the October meeting, pending the publication of the Board's Strategic Plan.
    395.1 ACTION ITEM: Chair and Secretary to add to agenda for October meeting.

396 **Update on Orientation package for new RSC members**
    396.1 Potential contents. A wishlist of potential contents was generated.
    396.2 Volunteers to work on first draft. Renate Behrens asked for volunteers to work on a first draft. Kathy Glennan and James Hennelly volunteered and Renate confirmed that she and the Secretary will welcome their input on a first draft for the October meeting and stressed that the goal is to have the package ready for new members starting in January 2024.
        396.2.1 ACTION ITEM: Kathy Glennan, James Hennelly and Anne Welsh led by Renate Behrens to work on a draft for the October meeting.
        396.2.2 ACTION ITEM: Chair and Secretary to add presentation of first draft to the agenda for the October meeting, and to the agendas for the Admin Team meetings in July-September.

397 **Recruitment of RDA Examples Editor.** Updates on actions were provided.
    397.1 Update to Examples Manual. An update on actions was provided.

398 **Training and Outreach**

398.1 Update from the Education and Orientation Officer. Elisa Sze reported that since the May 2023 meeting, she had continued to reach out to educators and trainers to discuss their approaches to integrating RDA into their teaching and training activities, including connecting with trainers in the public library setting. She is also continuing work on a handout for educators and trainers that builds on her report (RSC/Papers/2022/1 – Teaching RDA in the LIS Classroom) and webinar. Elisa has also been working on a proposed alternative view of the Guidance menu (Item 401.2.1)

398.2 Update from the Wider Community Engagement Officer. Charlene Chou provided some highlights from her activities since the May meeting, including delivering a webinar series on Cataloging e-resources in RDA organized by the National Central Library, Taipei, Taiwan. She attended the MARC Advisory Committee **(MAC)** meeting on 28-29 June and posted RSC responses to proposals and discussion papers on the MARC listserv prior to the MAC meeting.

398.3 Creation of permanent role of Education and Orientation Officer. Following the completion of Actions for Item 376 in the May Minutes, the Chair and Secretary asked for approval for updates to DRAFTS of several documents to be forwarded to the RDA Board along with RSC/Chair/2023/6 to seek approval for the extension of this role. **These amendments received unanimous approval.**

> **398.3.1 ACTION ITEM:** Secretary to finalise RSC/Chair/2023/6 and Chair to submit to the Board for approval.

399   Updates from Working Groups

399.1 Technical Working Group. The Technical Team Liaison Officer reported that since our last meeting, the Technical Working Group has implemented the changes to the RDA Registry resulting from RSC/PlacesWG/2023/1/Decisions. It is also starting on its revision of the Data Provenance guidance.

399.2 Translations Working Group. The Translations Team Liaison Officer reported his activities since our last meeting. Highlights included compiling 4 Fast Track proposals and encouraging the Romanian Librarian Association to join the RDA Community.

399.3 Examples Working Group. The Secretary reported that on 30 May we received approval from the Board for RSC/Chair/2023/2 to institute a Standing Working Group on Examples. The Chair reported that she had received applications for membership of the Working Group. The RDA Examples Editor shared a draft Terms of Reference document which, as agreed at the May Meeting (Item 391), she had prepared in consultation with the Director of ALA Digital Reference. There was some discussion of next steps, resulting in the following action items:

> **399.3.1 ACTION ITEM:** Secretary to draft a charge document based on the draft Terms of Reference discussed and agreed in this meeting. (Completed ahead of the Public Session on 2 August (Item 411.2))

399.3.2 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to draft updates to relevant Operations Documents.
399.3.3 ACTION ITEM: Chair and Secretary to add to agenda for Admin Team meeting on 19 July, at which Chair will lead a discussion on it.
399.3.4 ACTION ITEM: Chair and Secretary to add to agenda for October Meeting, with focus on updating the Action Plan.

399.4 Extent Working Group. The Extent Working Group has been continuing to work on its discussion paper.

399.4.1 Updated charge document for the Extent Working Group. The Secretary shared an updated charge document for the Extent Working Group, RSC/Chair/2023/7, and asked members to approve it. It was approved unanimously, and posted to the RSC website and archive on 17 July 2023.

399.5 Place/Jurisdiction Working Group. The Technical Team Liaison Officer and RSC Secretary have implemented the decisions in RSC/Places/WG/2023/1/Decisions and they will appear in the July Toolkit release. The Place/Jurisdiction Working Group is working on its discussion paper following the withdrawal of some sections of RSC/PlacesWG/2023/1 at the May RSC Meeting (Item 380).

399.6 Official Languages Working Group. The first proposal from the Official Languages Working Group is being discussed at the public meeting on 2 August (Item 409).

399.6.1 Updated charge document for the Official Languages Working Group. The Secretary shared an updated charge document for the Official Languages Working Group, RSC/Chair/2023/5, and asked members to approve it. It was approved unanimously, and posted to the RSC website and archive on 17 July 2023.

399.7 Religions in RDA Working Group. The first proposal from the Religions in RDA Working Group is being discussed at the public meeting on 2 August (Item 408). From June 2023, David Roth (National Library of Israel) became Co-chair of the Working Group.

399.7.1 Updated charge document for the Religions in RDA Working Group. The Secretary shared an updated charge document, RSC/Chair/2023/4, reflecting the new Co-chairs (Kate James, formerly Chair, and David Roth, formerly Working Group member), and asked members to approve it. It was approved unanimously, and posted to the RSC website and archive on 17 July 2023.

399.8 String Encoding Schemes Working Group. As SES are a major component of the work of the Extent Working Group, the suggestion had been received from the Chair of the Extent Working Group that the Extent Working Group would tackle the SES within their purview and then the RSC would look to establish a Task and Finish SES Working Group in 2024. This suggestion was voted on and received unanimous approval.

400   Update on Survey on Soft-deprecated terms. The first draft of the survey was shared. Several members of the RSC provided valuable feedback.

401   Update on RDA Toolkit

401.1   Latest release news. James Hennelly reported that releases for July and September are on schedule. He has afforded the Finnish Translation Team an extension of their deadline as they were just returning from vacation. The July release will include the frozen header for scrolling; updates to the Registry template to support both simplified and traditional script translations, and other improvements to Registry data processing. The alternate Guidance menu ([Item 401.2.2](#)) will be part of the September release.

401.2.1 Toolkit Development.

401.2.2 Proposed alternative view of the Guidance menu. Elisa Sze reported that since May ([RSC/Minutes/373-392](#) (Items 382.3 and 391.6)) she has collaborated with May Chan, Head, Metadata Services, University of Toronto Libraries to propose a refined alternative view of the Guidance menu. The alternative view received approval. James Hennelly said he will implement it in the September Toolkit release ([Item 401.1](#)). We will publish RSC/Minutes/393-412/rev following the September release to include Appendix 401.2.2, which is restricted until then.

402   Update on Fast Tracks. A proposed timetable was shared and approved.
    402.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to set up the Fast Tracks per the timetable, including to dos for voting members of the RSC.

403   October Meeting.
    403.1 ACTION ITEM: Chair, Secretary and Director of ALA Digital Reference to continue detailed planning with Austrian colleagues who will be hosting us.

404   January 2024. Members of the RSC were asked to share any dates on which they will be unavailable or will find it difficult to attend an asynchronous meeting. The decision for the dates of meetings resides with the Chair and the Director of ALA Digital Reference, but they will take these dates into consideration as best they can.
    404.1 ACTION ITEM: Chair and Director of ALA Digital Reference to set meeting dates for January.

405   Future Meetings. Members of the RSC were asked to share any dates on which they will be unavailable or will find it difficult to attend asynchronous meetings in April and July 2024. The decision for the dates of meetings resides with the Chair and the Director of ALA Digital Reference, but they will take these dates into consideration as best they can.

> **405.1 ACTION ITEM:** Chair and Director of ALA Digital Reference to set meeting dates for April and July.

Public Session

Note: This meeting took place on 2 August 2023, 7-11pm Central European Time, online via Zoom.

406   Welcome and Chair's summary of the Executive Session. Renate Behrens welcomed members of the RSC, the Working Group members in attendance, and, especially, the observers to this online public meeting. After some brief housekeeping notes, she shared her summary of the Executive Session, highlighting the following items:

> **406.1 RSC Action Plan**. The RDA Board's Strategic Plan 2023-2025 has been finalised and is now available on their website. This means that the RSC will be able to update its Action Plan in October (following on from Item 395).

> **406.2 Examples Working Group.** Internationalization is a key aim of both the RDA Board (Item 394) and the RSC (Item 395) and one key action that is being taken is the establishment of the Examples Working Group (Item 399.3). Following on from the discussion in the Executive Session, RSC/Chair/2023/8 – Examples Working Group, 2023-2024 was circulated to RSC members, to be voted on under Any Other Business in this Public Session (Item 411). Renate Behrens stressed that this is a group that is expected to grow, and asked all present (including observers) to encourage people to join. They can contact the Secretary, RSCsecretary@rdatoolkit.org in the first instance.

> **406.3 Wider Community Engagement**. Continuing the theme of internationalization, the work of the Wider Community Engagement Officer was highlighted (Item 398.2) alongside that of the Regional Representatives.

> **406.4 Working Groups**. These are all progressing well (Item 399), with RSC/PlacesWG/2023/Decisions implemented in the current release of the Toolkit and RSC/ReligionsWG/2023/1 (Item 408) and RSC/LanguagesWG/2023/1 (Item 409) under discussion today. Renate Behrens thanked the Co-Chair of the Religions in RDA Working Group, David Roth, and two members of the Official Languages Working Group, Daniel Paradis and Hanoch Roniger, for attending the meeting, and asked their permission to call upon them to introduce their groups' proposals at the appropriate place in the agenda.

407   Progress on the Protocol between the RSC and the IFLA Committee on Standards.
Renate Behrens extended a very warm welcome to Pat Riva, Secretary of the IFLA
Advisory Committee on Standards (CoS), and thanked her for agreeing to co-present this
agenda item with her.

407.1 History of the RSC protocols. For the benefit of observers, Renate Behrens
highlighted that the RSC has some long-standing protocols in place with various
international bodies, including several IFLA committees. One of her current tasks as
RSC Chair is updating these protocols, and in reviewing those with IFLA she realised
that establishing a protocol with CoS would be appropriate. Pat Riva confirmed that the
protocols had been established before the CoS was established in 2013 and gave an
overview of the previous reporting lines of the relevant committees that now fall under
the remit of IFLA CoS (BCM Review Group, ISBD Review Group, LIDATEC Review
Group, and the UNIMARC Review Group). When discussion was opened to observers,
Gordon Dunsire, who was RSC Chair when the existing protocols with IFLA were
established and is currently the RSC Liaison with the BCM Review Group, spoke
warmly of their importance and welcomed the establishment of the protocol between the
RSC and the IFLA Committee on Standards.

407.2 Next steps. The RSC approved RSC/Chair/2023/3/rev and it is proceeding
towards discussion at the CoS meeting during the World Library and Information
Congress (WLIC) 2023 in Rotterdam.

407.3 Thanks. Renate offered thanks to Gordon Dunsire for all his work as a liaison
between the RSC and IFLA over the years. She also thanked Pat Riva for her
contribution to this RSC Public Session.

408   RSC/ReligionsWG/2023/1 – [Proposal on] Religious Titles

408.1 Internationalization. In introducing the discussion of this proposal, Renate
Behrens highlighted the importance of internationalization of RDA, and summarised the
remit of the Religions in RDA Working Group, set out in RSC/Chair/2023/4 (and, before
it, RSC/Chair/2022/4): "The purpose of the Religions in RDA Working Group is to
support the improvement of the RDA standard by reviewing the guidance and
instructions (in all RDA entities) and making recommendations to move RDA toward
unbiased and inclusive treatment of world religions. A specific and more immediate goal
is to expand the non-Christian coverage in RDA. RSC concerns include the emphasis
given to Christianity and books of the Bible and the lack of attention to other religious
texts."

408.2 Introductory words from the Co-chair of the Religions in RDA Working Group. At the invitation of the RSC Chair, David Roth, Co-chair of the Working Group introduced the proposal, highlighting that the Working Group knows it is not comprehensive: it is a start. He summarised the context in which the Working Group's discussions and proposal writing has been undertaken, including *Western and Christian bias in the 3R Toolkit -* RSC/Minutes/Public/159-204 Appendix Item 166 and RSC/Minutes/Public/159-204 Item 166, both of which are referenced in the Working Group's charge documents (RSC/Chair/2023/4 (and, before it, RSC/Chair/2022/4)). The proposal under discussion, RSC/ReligionsWG/2023/1 proposes the removal of specific name heading examples from base RDA which the Working Group believes would be better placed in Application Profiles or in the new Community Resources area of the RDA Toolkit. As expressed in the 'Background' section of the proposal: "These options are specific to one religion and their application to other religions is often unclear. Even if there were a clear parallel in another religion, the options assume enough awareness of the tenets of Catholicism to know what would be parallel. Furthermore, the fact that all of the options relate to one religion is inherently biased. A comprehensive list which would include all religions would be impractical to create and would always be incomplete. Therefore, the options should be removed. Instructions on the inclusion of titles for specific religions should be community based and not part of base RDA."

408.3 Move to Community Resources. It was clear from the official responses to the proposal that RSC/ReligionsWG/2023/1/NARDAC response took a different view from the others. The NARDAC Representative, Robert Maxwell, shared their concerns. In particular, it was clear to NARDAC members that cataloguers need guidance on these issues. Their preference would be not to eliminate these examples, but to generalise them. EURIG Representative, Ahava Cohen, described the difficulty faced by different communities in parsing the instructions. Ahead of the meeting, she had shared the full text of the UK Committee on RDA (UK CoR), which she had initially not quoted in full in RSC/ReligionsWG/2023/1/EURIG response because there was consensus across EURIG to accept the proposal. Given that the UK and USA were the two communities originally responsible for these instructions which pre-date RDA, she thought it worth looking at the two different conclusions to the same issues. Current Chair of EURIG and outgoing Chair of UKCoR, Jenny Wright, was asked to read the UKCoR response for the benefit of meeting attendees, and it is published in the appendix to these minutes. A key difference that emerged through discussion was NARDAC's understanding that the instructions would be removed entirely, whereas other RSC members and regions had taken the proposal's suggestion that "Instructions on the inclusion of titles for specific religions should be community based and not part of base RDA" ('Background', p. 1, quoted at 408.2), to mean that they would be moved to the Community Resources section of the Toolkit. The ORDAC Representative, Charlotte Christensen, said that the ORDAC position remained, as stated in RSC/ReligionsWG/2023/1/ORDAC response, that these instructions belonged in Community Resources rather than base RDA.

408.4 Expanding / enumerating / generalising. Another strand of discussion focused on the interpretation of the Working Group's charge "to expand the non-Christian coverage in RDA" (p. 1, quoted at 408.1), which NARDAC took as a preference to extend the number of examples rather than removing them from base RDA. Should "expand" mean "enumerate"? After discussion, the RSC agreed that there was a danger of wordsmithing if the approach taken was expansion by enumeration. Reference was made to *Western and Christian bias in the 3R Toolkit* - RSC/Minutes/Public/159-204 Appendix Item 166 and RSC/Minutes/Public/159-204 Item 166, both of which are referenced in the Working Group's charge documents (RSC/Chair/2023/4 (and, before it, RSC/Chair/2022/4)). Past Chair, Kathy Glennan, who was responsible for the wording of the charge when the Working Group was established, read out the specific tasks set out in RSC/Chair/2022/4 and RSC/Chair/2023/4. She highlighted the second task, "Review the official Toolkit for known areas where instructions address resources or agents related to religions. The Community Resources area is an evolving part of the Toolkit that contains materials specific to communities (at the moment, primarily legacy Anglo-American instructions) and is not considered part of base RDA." This was intended to make it clear that "expand the non-Christian coverage in RDA" was always meant to include removing some instructions from base RDA to the Community Resources area of the RDA Toolkit. The Secretary read into the Minutes a statement from Thurstan Young, which he had sent in reply to a request from Ahava Cohen in support of the EURIG response. Ahava Cohen agreed that it would be ideal to see comprehensive work carried out on personas, official and unofficial names and nomen clusters, as Gordon Dunsire suggested. However, she was wary lest best be the enemy of good enough. The NARDAC Representative, Robert Maxwell, requested that it be noted that it looks strange that only *religious* titles are being moved from base RDA to Community Resources at this point.

408.5 Spirits. ORDAC Representative, Charlotte Christensen, highlighted that, as stated in RSC/Religions WG/2023/1/ORDAC response, it might be worth looking at the coverage of Spirit in a non-religious setting. The Technical Team Liaison Officer pointed out that it could be dealt with as a persona. There is always the option to add a characterising word or phrase to a name heading. He referred to RSC/ReligionsWG/2023/1/RDA Examples Editor response. Charlotte Christensen agreed that was acceptable. In the context of the suggestion to remove the example from base RDA, Past Chair, Kathy Glennan, strongly recommended that any specific instruction for Spirit should be dealt with at a community level.

408.6 Speed of implementation. Both Past Chair, Kathy Glennan, and previous Chair, Gordon Dunsire, expressed a wariness of dealing with access points rather than elements. Gordon Dunsire highlighted that there are wider issues of which the RSC is aware, to do with the handling of official names versus unofficial names, personas and nomen clusters. Knowing that this is the first of several proposals from the Working Group, Kathy Glennan asked the RSC to consider approving the current proposal but delaying

its implementation until the Working Group had discussed the issues raised by UKCoR and proposed changes to deal with those.

408.7 RSC/ReligionsWG/2023/1 approved by majority vote. The RSC accepted Kathy Glennan's suggestion on speed of implementation (408.6), and the Technical Team Liaison Officer proposed a vote that the proposal be accepted, with the contents of the instructions moving to Community Resources. The proposal was approved on a majority vote. There was one absence and one acceptance.

408.8 Thanks. The RSC Chair thanked the Co-chairs and the member of the Religions in RDA Working Group for their work on this proposal.

408.9 ACTION ITEMS

408.9.1 Secretary to pass the RSC's request to the Co-chairs of the Religions in RDA Working Group that they look at the areas highlighted by UKCoR and prepare a proposal or discussion paper covering at least those areas. They should also be asked to consider elements impacted by the relocation of these instructions from base RDA to Community Resources, and to prepare a proposal or discussion paper covering these.

408.9.2 Secretary to include 408.9.1 in RSC/ReligionsWG/2023/1/Decisions.

408.9.3 Director of ALA Reference, Secretary and Technical Team Liaison Officer to postpone implementation of RSC/ReligionsWG/2023/1/Decisions until after approval of (a) proposal(s) from the Religions in RDA Working Group dealing with 408.9.1.

408.9.4 Taking on the Working Group Co-chair's comments that this is just the beginning of the process (408.2), RSC Chair to discuss the extension of the Working Group's charge beyond its initial term.

409 RSC/LanguagesWG/2023/1 – [Proposal on] Preferred Names and Official Languages of Corporate Bodies, Governments and Places in RDA

409.1 Internationalization. In introducing the discussion of this proposal, Renate Behrens highlighted the importance of internationalization of RDA, and summarised its remit in RSC/Chair/2023/5 (and before that RSC/Chair/2022/2).

409.2 Introductory remarks from the Official Languages Working Group. At the invitation of the RSC Chair, Working Group members Daniel Paradis and Hanoch Roniger described its aims, as set out in the abstract of RSC/LanguagesWG/2023/1:

"The working group was charged with analyzing the concept of "official language" for corporate bodies, and specifically to consider the text in four sections of RDA:

● Corporate Body: preferred name of corporate body
● Corporate Body: category of corporate body
● Corporate Body: category of government
● Place: preferred name of place

For corporate bodies, we have decided that official languages can be too difficult to determine and that an insistence on using them in recording the preferred name of a body can produce results that are not always true to the nature of the body and that also do not serve libraries and their patrons in different national and linguistic environments. We recommend deleting some conditions to give cataloging agencies more flexibility in applying the existing options around the language of the preferred name of a corporate body.

Our charge also includes looking at the preferred name of places, and we have recommendations for changes in this area as well. We support keeping the concept of official languages for places, but recommend removing some redundancy in the text and also making some implicit conditions more explicit."

They also highlighted the issue of scripts, which was not part of their charge, but which they found affecting many issues under discussion – after all, languages are expressed (in writing) in scripts.

409.3 Dual naming. ORDAC Representative, Charlotte Christensen, highlighted the issue of dual naming shared in [RSC/LanguagesWG/2023/1/ORDAC response](#) and stressed that this does not refer to the repetition of a name in one language and then in another, but to a name that consists of words in two languages. Examples given in [RSC/LanguagesWG/2023/1/ORDAC response](#) for corporate bodies were:
"Oranga Tamariki Ministry for Children
Kāinga Ora Homes and Communities
Museum of New Zealand Te Papa Tongarewa
Heritage New Zealand Pouhere Taonga"
For place names, the examples given were:
"Uluru / Ayers Rock (Australia)
Aoraki / Mount Cook (New Zealand)"
Daniel Paradis said that this was not an issue that had been discussed by the Official Languages Working Group. There followed some discussion on whether this should be an issue best dealt with by the Official Languages Working Group or by ORDAC. The RSC decided that given their expertise in dealing with these corporate bodies and place names, ORDAC should take the lead in writing a proposal, drawing on the expertise of both the Official Languages Working Group and the Places/Jurisdictions Working Group.

409.3.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to alert the Chairs of the Official Languages and Places/Jurisdictions Working Groups that ORDAC are preparing a proposal on dual

naming and to connect the ORDAC Representative so they can offer comments on ORDAC's draft proposal.

409.3.2 ACTION ITEM: ORDAC Representative to work with ORDAC on a proposal, asking the Chairs of the Places/Jurisdictions and Official Languages Working Groups for input.

409.4 Expression of elements of condition. The NARDAC Representative, Robert Maxwell, highlighted the issue raised in RSC/LanguagesWG/2023/1/NARDAC response that for Recommendation 4, "The condition in the first condition box should be split to preserve parallelism with next condition box. "A value of a name is in a language that is preferred by an agent who creates the metadata and is in general use" should be split into two lines: "A value of a name is in a language that is preferred by an agent who creates the metadata" and "A name of a place is in general use". There is already an implicit "AND" between condition lines." Daniel Paradis provided an account as to why the Working Group expressed this condition as it did. The Secretary shared that there are other examples in which the format used by the Working Group has been used elsewhere in the Toolkit. Both the NARDAC and the ORDAC representatives felt there were cases in which the wording could potentially be obfuscatory. The RSC decided that this was an editorial issue and they would vote on the principle expressed in the Recommendation and the rest of the proposal, and the Secretary could be left to figure out the editorial issue. The Secretary said when she is writing RSC/LanguagesWG/2023/1/Decisions she will run the final wording of Recommendation 4 in past the Working Group, and the NARDAC and ORDAC representatives to ensure that potential for confusion is minimised.

409.5 RSC/LanguagesWG/2023/1 approved by majority approval. The proposal was approved on a majority vote. There was one absence.

409.5.1 ACTION ITEM: Secretary to prepare RSC/Languages/2023/1/Decisions and implement in line with the RDA Toolkit Release Schedule (January 2024 release).

410 **Survey on Soft-deprecated terms.** The Technical Team Liaison Officer shared the Survey on Soft-deprecated terms, providing an overview for the benefit of observers. The survey will close on 15 September 2023, to give him time to collate responses for the October meeting of the RSC. The Secretary shared that she would post a news item to the RSC website on 3 August and share a post to RDA-L on 4 August.

411 **Any Other Business**

411.1 Ethnic or indigenous group as Agent. Charlotte Christensen raised this issue and discussion ensued. Renate Behrens suggested that it might be useful to introduce a topic

for content-related questions for the October meeting as a possibility for the RSC to discuss more theoretically about the standard.

411.1.1 ACTION ITEM: Chair and Secretary to add space for theoretical discussion to the agenda for the October Meeting.

411.2 Formal approval of RSC/Chair/2023/8 – Examples Working Group, 2023-2024. Following discussion in the Executive Session (Item 399.3), the Secretary completed ACTION ITEM 399.3.1 and circulated RSC/Chair/2023/8 ahead of the Public Session of the meeting. It was approved by all voting members in attendance. There was one absence.

411.3 Formal approval of RSC/Chair/2023/10 – RDA/MARC21 Alignment Task Force, 2023. Following the promotion of Thurstan Young, for which the RSC offered formal congratulations, Corine Deliot will take his place on the RDA/MARC21 Alignment Task Force, precipitating the updating of its charge document. On behalf of the RSC, Renate Behrens offered her thanks to Thustan Young for his service over many years, and, also on behalf of the RSC, she extended a warm welcome to Corine Deliot. RSC/Chair/2023/10 was circulated to the RSC ahead of the meeting and was approved by all voting members in attendance. There was one absence.

411.4 Formal approval of RSC/Chair/2023/9 – Technical Working Group, 2023. As we were updating the charge for the RDA/MARC21 Alignment Task Force, whose management falls under the Technical Working Group, it was appropriate to update the Technical Working Group's own charge document. RSC/Chair/2023/9 was circulated to the RSC ahead of the meeting and was approved by all voting members in attendance. There was one absence.

411.5 Announcement of the October Meeting. For the benefit of observers, the RSC Chair shared that planning is underway for the RSC October Meeting. An announcement has been posted to the RSC website that the RSC Chair and the Director of ALA Digital Reference have accepted the invitation from OBVSG in Vienna to host the October meeting at their offices in Vienna. There will be an opportunity for observers to attend a public session in person and online and there will be a training event featuring speakers from the RSC and the DACH Region, in person and online. Observers of this meeting and those who have let the Secretary know they would like to be on her list of observers will receive courtesy emails about registration. Further announcements will be published to the news section of the RSC website as soon as they are available.

411.5.1 Publication of RDA DACH. One of the reasons that an RSC Meeting in Vienna is well-timed is because the DACH Region is implementing Official RDA. As part of this process, the Dokumentationsplattform des Standardiseierungsausschusses has been published, and is available open access.

411.5.2 Topics for Training at the October Meeting. Renate Behrens asked observers if there were any topics they would particularly like to see covered at the Training Day in the October Meeting. Shawne Miksa requested RDA for cataloguing educators.

412   Thanks from Chair. Renate Behrens thanked RSC members, Working group members and, especially observers, for their attendance and contributions to this Public Session.

Approved by the RSC
29 August 2023.

APPENDIX

408.3 UK Committee on RDA (UKCoR) response to RSC/ReligionsWG/2023/1

2023 Recommendation 1: Access point for person. Additional elements and designations in access points for person. Delete the option "Include the term Pope or Antipope."

UKCoR Response: Agreed. Religious bias also exists in the following elements: Term of rank or honour or office, Creator corporate body of work. The bias also exists in the definition of the following glossary term: Official communication. If the intention is to remove religious bias from RDA, then there should be a consistent approach across the Toolkit.

2023 Recommendation 2: Access point for person. Additional elements and designations in access points for person. Delete the option "Include a term or part of a term of rank of bishop, etc., or other religious vocation that appears with a name of a person in manifestations associated with the person or in another source of information, following a given name that is recorded as the first part of the name."

UKCoR Response: Agreed. Please also see response to recommendation 1.

2023 Recommendation 3: Access point for person. Additional elements and designations in access points for person. Delete the option "Include the term Saint unless the person is a pope, emperor, king or queen."

UKCoR Response: Agreed. Please also see response to recommendation 1.

2023 Recommendation 4: Access point for person. Additional elements and designations in access points for person. Delete the option "Include the term Spirit for a person represented as a spirit."

UKCoR Response: Agreed. Please also see response to recommendation 1.

408.4 Statement from Thurstan Young to Ahava Cohen and Anne Welsh, 1 August

It is my personal view that the treatment of religious titles in the context of community resources makes sense. Whether those resources are hosted in or outside the Toolkit is a different matter. RDA's community resources area already contains material which relates to AAPs, preferred titles and related agents of religious works. Handling religious titles in the same context, if not location, makes sense for purposes of consistency. If RDA's base documents are generalized or expanded to encompass non-western contexts, then I am concerned that it may lead to an expansion of conditional and optional content in those documents. A complete removal of religious titles from base RDA seems more achievable than an attempt to offer more comprehensive coverage; half measures may be regarded as bias by any religious community which is excluded (either consciously or unconsciously) as part of the editorial process.