

TO: RDA Steering Committee

FROM: Dave Reser, LC Representative

SUBJECT: Language and Script instructions for Chapters 6 and 7

Related documents: 6JSC/MusicWG/13/LC response; RSC/LC/2/Appendix

Abstract: This proposal offers an addition to 5.4 that would provide an instruction on recording most elements in chapters 6 and 7 (e.g., history of the work, intended audience, and nature of the content) in the preferred language and script of the agency creating the data. Elements such as preferred title of the work and date of work that are not appropriate to record in the preferred language and script of the agency creating the data are not impacted by this change. RDA 6.2 provides instructions on language and script for preferred and variant titles for works. RDA 6.3 (Date of Work) and 6.11 (Date of Expression) do not need language and script instructions because they say to record the date as a year “in terms of the calendar preferred by the agency creating the data.” If an agency chooses a calendar in which language and script is relevant (e.g., the Japanese calendar), it is covered within this instruction.

Justification

Most elements in chapters 6 and 7 should be recorded in the language and script of the agency creating the data. Notable exceptions are titles and elements for which language and script are not usually applicable (e.g., scale). RDA 0.11.2 conveys this assumption, “When the instructions for an element specify transcription, data are transcribed in the language and script in which they appear on the source of information . . .” and “Other elements are generally recorded in a language and script preferred by the agency creating the data.” The examples in chapters 6 and 7 also reflect this assumption.

Chapter 6

RDA 5.4 suggests that instructions on language and script for recording elements will be found throughout chapter 6 at the appropriate element: “Record other identifying attributes of a work or expression in the language and script specified in the applicable instructions in chapter 6.”

However, when catalogers look at the specific element instructions in this chapter, they usually do not find instructions about language and script. A few elements, such as 6.11 (Language of Expression), do contain an instruction to “record the language or languages of expression using an appropriate term or terms in a language preferred by the agency creating the data.” Script is missing from these instructions. Moreover, most chapter 6 elements that would logically be recorded in an agency’s preferred language and script, such as History of the Work (6.7), contain no such instructions.

LC commented on this gap in instructions in its response to 6JSC/MusicWG/13. We noted that the JSC might want to consider a more general approach at 5.4 rather than replicating instructions throughout the chapter. As part of that discussion at the 2015 JSC meeting, LC and the JSC Secretary were tasked to “Identify where [the] phrase ‘in a language (and script) preferred by the agency creating the data’ should be in RDA at a higher level than in separate instructions or in an AP.”

Chapter 7

Choice of language and script is relevant for recording many elements in chapter 7. RDA 5.4 says, “Record the descriptive attributes of a work or expression covered in chapter 7 in a language and script preferred by the agency creating the data.” This provides a blanket instruction for all chapter 7 elements, and yet there is an explicit instruction about recording “in a language and script preferred by the agency creating the data” at 7.13.2.3. This instruction is redundant and may cause catalogers to wonder why it is repeated for this element and not others. The bigger problem with 5.4 is that it prohibits recording a quotation from a resource as an element or part of an element unless that quotation is in the language and script of the agency creating the data. Additional Scale Information (7.25.5) contains instructions on using a quotation from a resource for the element. There are several examples of quotations used for chapter 7 elements, and these seem appropriate and logical to us. Because of these disparities, we think 5.4 should be revised to include an exception for quotations from a resource (see Proposed Revision 1).

Issues requiring resolution

Chapter 6 issues

Title of the Work (6.2) is well covered in existing chapter 6 instructions so there are no issues requiring resolution for it. Instructions for these chapter 6 elements also require no revision (see RSC/LC/2/Appendix for details):

- Date of Work (6.4)
- Place of Origin of the Work (6.5)
- Content Type (6.9)
- Date of Expression (6.11).

The question for other chapter 6 elements is whether to provide instructions about language and script for each element, or to provide a general instruction in 5.4 that can be used for most of them. LC proposes adding a general instruction in 5.4 that covers language and script instructions for most of the other chapter 6 elements. LC also proposes deleting instructions in 6.11.1.3 and 6.15.1.5 because they will be made redundant by our proposed change to 5.4. There are a few chapter 6 instructions that we recommend retaining because the instructions vary depending on the element sub-type or type of work (see RSC/LC/2/Appendix).

Chapter 7 issues

The conflict between recording a quotation for chapter 7 elements and the lack of an instruction in 5.4 requires resolution. LC believes it is appropriate to record a quotation sometimes (especially when the instruction says to record the information from a source within the resource), and a quotation should either be recorded in the language and script in which it appears or in a transliterated form of the language in which it appears. We proposed an exception with an alternative for or 5.4 that would allow transliteration. If the RSC does not agree, the instructions at 7.25.5.3 need to be revised to remove instructions for recording additional scale information in quotation marks.

In addition to the lack of language and script instructions, we discovered a lack of instructions for recording names as part of some elements in chapters 6 and 7 (e.g., identifier for the work may contain a number and the name of an institution). There is also an issue involving how to record place of capture in chapter 7. We have not proposed to resolve these issues now because they are more complex and outside the scope of our assignment. They are presented in a section of this document called *Issues for Further Discussion*.

A table of all the elements in chapters 6 and 7 with the results of our analysis is provided as RSC/LC/2/Appendix.

Impact of the revisions

As shown in our proposed revisions, some instructions in chapters 6 and 7 would be revised to delete language and script instructions there in favor of the generalized instruction in 5.4. Long-term maintenance of RDA will be easier because there will be fewer instructions about language and script. The examples are not impacted because the assumption has been that the elements discussed are recorded in the language and script of the agency creating the data.

We do not think that adding “and script” after language at 6.16.1.3.1 will change what is already intended in that instruction—for agencies to use captions in a form understandable to their users.

This proposal should not impact the practice of RDA user communities as our observation is that agencies are recording these elements in their preferred language and script. Individual agencies may need to make some adjustments to their “policy statements” to remove decisions documented for individual elements and add a decision to 5.4.

Finally, this revision resolves a discrepancy between the instructions in 5.4 and some instructions in chapter 7.

Summary of proposed revisions:

- **Proposed Revision 1:** *Revise 5.4 to include all elements not otherwise specified;*

add an exception for quotations from a resource with an alternative to that exception for transliteration (modeled on 1.4 exception and alternative to exception)

- **Proposed Revision 2:** *Revise instruction at 6.11.1.3 because it will be covered by 5.4*
- **Proposed Revision 3:** *Revise instruction at 6.15.1.5 because it will be covered by 5.4*
- **Proposed Revision 4:** *Revise instruction at 6.16.1.3.1 to include script*
- **Proposed Revision 5:** *Revise instruction at 7.13.2.3 because it will be covered by 5.4*

Note: No changes are needed to the RDA Element Set.

Proposed Revision 1:

Mark-up:

5.4 Language and Script

Record titles for works in the language and script in which they appear on the sources from which they are taken.

Alternative

Record a transliterated form of the title either as a substitute for, or in addition to, the form that appears on the source.

Record other identifying attributes of a work or expression in the language and script preferred by the agency creating the data unless the instructions for a specific element indicate otherwise. specified in the applicable instructions in chapter ~~6~~**RDA**.

~~Record the descriptive attributes of a work or expression covered in chapter 7~~**RDA** in a language and script preferred by the agency creating the data.

Exception

When recording a quotation from a resource as an attribute of a work or expression, record the quotation in the language and script in which it appears in the source from which it was taken.

Alternative

Record a quotation from a resource as an attribute of a work or expression in a transliterated form.

Clean copy:

5.4 Language and Script

Record titles for works in the language and script in which they appear on the sources from which they are taken.

Alternative

Record a transliterated form of the title either as a substitute for, or in addition to, the form that appears on the source.

Record other attributes of a work or expression in the language and script preferred by the agency creating the data unless the instructions for a specific element indicate otherwise.

Exception

When recording a quotation from a resource as an attribute of a work or expression, record the quotation in the language and script in which it appears in the source from which it was taken.

Alternative

Record a quotation from a resource as an attribute of a work or expression in a transliterated form.

Proposed Revision 2:

Mark-up:

6.11.1.3 Recording Language of Expression

~~Record the language or languages of the expression using an appropriate term or terms in a language preferred by the agency creating the data.~~

Select terms from a standard list of names of languages, if available.

[remainder of instruction unchanged]

Clean copy:

6.11.1.3 Recording Language of Expression

Record the language or languages of the expression. Select terms from a standard list of names of languages, if available.

[remainder of instruction unchanged]

Proposed Revision 3:

Mark-up:

6.15.1.5 Instruments

~~When recording names of instruments, use a term in a language and script preferred by the agency creating the data whenever possible. Record the instrument or instruments. Use the following terms a guide:~~

[remainder of instruction unchanged]

Clean copy:

6.15.1.5 Instruments

Record the instrument or instruments. Use the following terms a guide:

[remainder of instruction unchanged]

Proposed Revision 4:

Mark-up:

6.16.1.3.1 Serial Number

Record the serial number or numbers of a musical work. Record the number as a cardinal numeral.

Record the caption in a language and script preferred by the agency creating the data if there is a satisfactory equivalent in that language and script.

Alternative

Record the caption in the language and script in which it appears on the sources from which it is taken.

[remainder of instruction unchanged]

Clean copy:

6.16.1.3.1 Serial Number

Record the serial number or numbers of a musical work. Record the number as a cardinal numeral.

Record the caption in a language and script preferred by the agency creating the data if there is a satisfactory equivalent in that language and script.

Alternative

Record the caption in the language and script in which it appears on the sources from which it is taken.

[remainder of instruction unchanged]

Proposed Revision 5:

Mark-up:

7.13.2.3 Recording Scripts

Record the script or scripts used to express the language content of the resource ~~using an appropriate term or terms in a language preferred by the agency creating the data~~. Select terms from a standard list of names of scripts, if available.

[remainder of instruction unchanged]

Clean copy:

7.13.2.3 Recording Scripts

Record the script or scripts used to express the language content of the resource. Select terms from a standard list of names of scripts, if available.

[remainder of instruction unchanged]

Issues for Further Discussion

6.8 Identifier for the Work and 6.13 Identifier for the Expression:

Both of these elements may contain the name of the agency assigning the identifier but no instruction on how that name should be recorded. RDA 9.13 provides an instruction to record the affiliation as the preferred name of the group so that could serve as a model. The RSC may wish to provide instructions in the future on the form of name that should be recorded for these two elements. If so, we also note that other instructions on identifiers that allow for recording an agency name would need modification. These instructions are 2.20.1.4, 9.18.1.3, 10.10.1.3, and 11.12.1.3.

7.9 Dissertation or Thesis Information:

This element contains three sub-elements. Two of those sub-elements are recorded in a language and script—*academic degree* and *granting institution or faculty*. Another issue with *granting institution or faculty* is which form of name within the same language to use (e.g., UConn vs. University of Connecticut). We feel the general instruction proposed at 5.4 is sufficient for *academic degree*, but the RSC may wish to consider in the future if instructions regarding the form of name for the *granting institution or faculty* should be

added.

7.11 Place and Date of Capture:

This element contains 2 sub-elements—*place of capture* and *date of capture*. There are no instructions on the form of name of the place nor the language and script to be used for the recording the month. We briefly considered adding instructions modeled on 6.5 (place of origin of the work) and 9.3 (date associated with the person). However, we rejected this idea because we do not think that *place of capture* conforms to the RDA definition of place. The instructions for *place of capture* state that the name of a studio, concert hall, etc., is required for this element as well as the city. The RSC may wish to reconsider *place of capture* in the context of chapter 16 and other elements dealing with place.