

To: RDA Steering Committee
From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative
Subject: Proposal on Sources of Information (RDA 2.2.2)

ALA thanks the European community for this proposal to revise RDA 2.2.2 in relation to moving images and digital documents. We do not agree with the proposal as written; however, we offer the following comments and recommendations to address the concerns raised.

Changes to RDA 2.2.2.3, Resources Consisting of Moving Images

ALA agrees that this instruction should be clarified. However, we do not agree with the proposed change to the alternative in 2.2.2.3, which places the label and the container in the same order of preference. We stand by our original recommendations about the source of information instructions laid out in 6JSC/ALA/21:

- Labels should be preferred over containers and accompanying material (unless the label does not include a collective title, and the container or accompanying material does).
- Containers and accompanying material should be preferred over embedded metadata.
- For tangible electronic resources, either a label or an internal source may be used.
- For online resources, either the textual content or embedded metadata may be used.

However, we recognize that the current instructions do not fully support the normal approach used by the German-speaking community in cataloguing moving image resources. To that end, we recommend the following revision, which:

1. Streamlines the existing instruction.
2. References the sub-instructions by name and clearly indicates when they should be applied.
3. Rephrases the existing instruction in 2.2.2.3 and introduces an alternative in 2.2.2.3.1 that exclusively reflects cataloguer's judgment.

Marked-up copy (base text: current RDA)

2.2.2.3 Resources Consisting of Moving Images

If the resource consists of moving images (e.g., a film reel, a videodisc, a video game, an MPEG video file), use the title frame or frames, or title screen or screens, as the preferred source of information.

If:

the title frames or title screens only list the titles of the individual contents and another source forming part of the resource has a formally-presented collective title

or

the resource does not contain a title frame or title screen

then:

choose the preferred source of information by applying these instructions, as applicable:

tangible resources (see [2.2.2.3.1](#))

online resources (see [2.2.2.3.2](#)).

~~use as the preferred source of information the first applicable source with a formally-presented collective title.~~

Alternative

For tangible resources, choose the preferred source of information by applying the instructions at [2.2.2.3.1](#).~~Use a label with a title that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource in preference to the title frame or frames, or title screen or screens. This alternative does not apply to labels on accompanying textual material or a container.~~

~~If the resource does not contain a title frame or title screen, apply the following guidelines for tangible or online resources to choose the preferred source of information.~~

If a source other than a title frame or title screen is used as the preferred source of information, make a note on the title source (see [2.17.2.3](#)).

2.2.2.3.1 Tangible Resources

Use as the preferred source of information the first of the following with a title:

- a) a label that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource,~~excluding accompanying textual material or a container~~ (e.g., a label on a videodisc)
- b) ~~for a comprehensive description,~~ a container ~~or accompanying material~~ issued with the resource
- c) an internal source forming part of a tangible digital resource (e.g., a disc menu).

Alternative

Use as the preferred source of information the source preferred by the agency preparing the description.

If none of these sources has a title, use as the preferred source of information another source forming part of the resource itself, giving preference to sources in which the information is

formally presented.

2.2.2.3.2 Online Resources

[Instruction unchanged.]

Clean copy

2.2.2.3 Resources Consisting of Moving Images

If the resource consists of moving images (e.g., a film reel, a videodisc, a video game, an MPEG video file), use the title frame or frames, or title screen or screens, as the preferred source of information.

If:

the title frames or title screens only list the titles of the individual contents and another source forming part of the resource has a formally-presented collective title

or

the resource does not contain a title frame or title screen

then:

choose the preferred source of information by applying these instructions, as applicable:

tangible resources (see [2.2.2.3.1](#))

online resources (see [2.2.2.3.2](#)).

Alternative

For tangible resources, choose the preferred source of information by applying the instructions at [2.2.2.3.1](#).

If a source other than a title frame or title screen is used as the preferred source of information, make a note on the title source (see [2.17.2.3](#)).

2.2.2.3.1 Tangible Resources

Use as the preferred source of information the first of the following with a title:

- a) a label that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource (e.g., a label on a videodisc)
- b) a container issued with the resource
- c) an internal source forming part of a tangible digital resource (e.g., a disc menu).

Alternative

Use as the preferred source of information the source preferred by the agency preparing the description.

If none of these sources has a title, use as the preferred source of information another source forming part of the resource itself, giving preference to sources in which the information is formally presented.

2.2.2.3.2 Online Resources

[Instruction unchanged.]

Definition of container

ALA agrees that the definition of the term container in the RDA Glossary could be improved to address information that can be read through the closed container, and we concur that it is time to incorporate clear guidance into RDA. However, we prefer a simpler approach, based on long-standing guidance from the U.S. cataloguing community:

- The LCRI for AACR2 6.0B1: “For compact discs and cassettes, consider information which can be read through the closed container (including information on the front cover of a booklet inserted in the container) to be on the container.”
- The Music Library Association RDA Best Practices for RDA 2.1.2.3: “Note that a booklet cover which is visible through the front of a container forms part of that container.”

We recommend the following addition to the RDA Glossary entry for container:

Marked-up copy (base text: current RDA) – no clean copy provided

container

A housing that is physically separable from the resource being housed. A container includes a box for a disc or video cassette, a sleeve for a videodisc, etc. Consider information which is visible through the housing to be on the container.

Changes to RDA 2.2.2.4.1, Tangible Resources (sub-instruction of Other Resources)

ALA does not agree with the proposed change. However, we suggest some simplification, which parallels our rewording suggestions for 2.2.2.3.1, along with the addition of the same alternative:

Marked-up copy (base text: current RDA)

2.2.2.4.1 Tangible Resources

Use as the preferred source of information the first of the following with a title:

- a) a textual source on the resource itself (e.g., a slide) or a label that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource, ~~excluding accompanying textual material or a container~~ (e.g., a label on an audio CD or a model)
- b) an internal source, such as a title screen, whose textual content formally presents the title
- c) ~~for a comprehensive description,~~ a container or accompanying material issued with the resource.

Alternative

Use as the preferred source of information the source preferred by the agency preparing the description.

If none of these sources has a title, use as the preferred source of information another source forming part of the resource itself, giving preference to sources in which the information is formally presented.

Clean copy

2.2.2.4.1 Tangible Resources

Use as the preferred source of information the first of the following with a title:

- a) a textual source on the resource itself (e.g., a slide) or a label that is permanently printed on or affixed to the resource (e.g., a label on an audio CD or a model)
- b) an internal source, such as a title screen, whose textual content formally presents the title
- c) a container or accompanying material issued with the resource.

Alternative

Use as the preferred source of information the source preferred by the agency preparing the description.

If none of these sources has a title, use as the preferred source of information another source forming part of the resource itself, giving preference to sources in which the information is formally presented.

Changes to 2.2.2.1, General Guidelines

ALA agrees that landing pages may be the only place to find manifestation-specific information about a particular online resource. We also concur that it is reasonable to consider this information to be part of the resource itself. However, we do not agree with characterizing this as “accompanying material.” We believe it functions more like information on a container. As with our suggested revisions detailed above, we think that the landing page, etc. should be considered part of the resource regardless of the type of description provided.

Thus we recommend adding the following paragraph as the new 6th paragraph (following the paragraph which begins “Treat a container...”):

Consider information presented together with or alongside online resources (e.g., landing pages, jump-off pages, metadata pages) to be part of the resource.