

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative
Subject: Revisions to Numeric Designation of a Musical Work (6.16)

ALA thanks the JSC Music Working Group for this proposal to clarify and broaden the instructions for recording numeric designations associated with a musical work. While we support the need to revise these instructions, we suggest taking a somewhat different approach, as detailed below.

Change #1 – 6.16.1.1 & Change #5 - Glossary

ALA supports the addition of the new paragraph here and in the Glossary. However, we have a minor rewording suggestion for the new paragraph. Based on the definition and use of the term of “numeric designation of a musical work” in these instructions, we believe that the caption is included in the designation, rather than serving as an accompaniment to it. We also recommend changing making the terms in the parentheses an “e.g.” list, instead of presenting them in italics. Thus we suggest rephrasing the final sentence to:

A numeric designation includes a caption (e.g., no., op., BWV).

Change #2 – 6.16.1.3

We recommend keeping the instructions in 6.16.1.3 very general. We disagree with the Working Group that this instruction should be limited to individual musical works, since this is about recording attributes, not choosing preferred titles. Any limitations on what is included in an authorized access point will be addressed by instructions in 6.27 and 6.28.

We believe that the language issues raised by the JSC Music Working Group are limited to serial numbers, since opus numbers should use the abbreviation “op.”, and thematic index numbers should use the designations and numbering as found in the thematic index. Thus, any clarification of the instructions for language of the caption should appear in 6.16.1.3.1. Likewise, we recommend moving the instruction regarding using abbreviations to 6.16.1.3.1 (see our recommendations below under Change #3). In this scenario, that sentence that specifically says to use the abbreviation “op.”, should also be added to 6.16.1.3.2 (see below under Change #3.5).

The proposed revision below reflects the following recommendations:

- Using “a musical work” rather than “musical works” in the 1st paragraph.
- Creating a reference structure to specifically name the sub-instructions.
- Deleting the inclusive numbering instructions, with an understanding that they should reside in an application profile instead.

In relation to this last recommendation, ALA observes that those who are not music specialists have a difficult time conceiving how a single work can have inclusive numbering.

This type of detailed instruction, while helpful, addresses an exceptional situation that might be better addressed in an application profile.

Marked-up copy (from the current RDA instructions)

6.16.1.3 Recording Numeric Designations of Musical Works

Record as many of the following numeric designations of a musical works as can readily be ascertained:

serial number (see 6.16.1.3.1)

opus number (see 6.16.1.3.2)

thematic index number (see 6.16.1.3.3).

~~Use abbreviations as instructed in appendix B (B.5.4). Use inclusive numbering for an aggregate work that is identified by consecutive serial numbers or thematic index numbers in music reference sources and/or thematic indexes.~~

Record numeric designations of a musical works as separate elements, as parts of access points, or as both. For instructions on recording a numeric designation of a musical work as part of the authorized access point, see **6.28.1.9–6.28.1.10**.

Clean copy

6.16.1.3 Recording Numeric Designations of Musical Works

Record as many of the following numeric designations of a musical work as can readily be ascertained:

serial number (see **6.16.1.3.1**)

opus number (see **6.16.1.3.2**)

thematic index number (see **6.16.1.3.3**).

Record numeric designations of a musical work as separate elements, as parts of access points, or as both. For instructions on recording a numeric designation of a musical work as part of the authorized access point, see **6.28.1.9–6.28.1.10**.

Change #3 – 6.16.1.3.1 – *Two options*

As the Working Group has noted, numeric designations of musical works consist of both numbers and captions. As mentioned in our comments under Change #2, ALA believes that the instructions specific to recording numbers and captions are needed in this sub-instruction, for serial numbers. Thus, we have moved the WG's suggested instruction about recording the caption in the language preferred by the cataloging agency to this sub-instruction.

However, we have not proposed adding the WG's suggested clause "if there is a satisfactory equivalent in that language". ALA is uncertain exactly what is meant by the RDA phrase "in a language preferred by the agency creating the data". We see two possibilities:

- a mandate to use a single language (i.e., always record the data in English);
- flexibility to apply different languages in different situations (e.g., English in these cases, French in these cases, etc.)

A common understanding of the application of this phrase will help inform whether or not the phrase "if there is a satisfactory equivalent in that language" is needed here.

ALA offers two options for revising 6.13.1.3.1, which differ in their treatment of recording the numbering:

- **Option 1:** *Record the number in cardinal or ordinal form based on how the work is commonly identified either through use in resources embodying the work or in reference sources.*

This option parallels the instructions for recording opus numbers (6.13.1.3.2) and thematic index numbers (6.13.1.3.3). It also more closely parallels the instructions for a part or parts of a musical work (6.14.2.7). In that instruction, the designation of the part is included in the preferred title; thus the language of the caption is recorded in the language of the preferred title.

However, the serial number associated with a musical work is not part of the preferred title. As noted above, ALA concurs with the Working Group that the caption should be recorded in a language preferred by the cataloging agency. This conclusion leads us to question if similar flexibility should be extended to the numbering of the designation (see Option 2).

- **Option 2:** *Record the number as a numeral.*

This option takes a straightforward approach, which offers flexibility in recording both the caption and the number. Along with recording the caption in a language preferred by the cataloging agency, the number would be recorded as a numeral – with no need to consult reference sources to determine the appropriate form. This option may require additional guidance in application profiles.

ALA acknowledges that this would be a significant change in practice, resulting in serial number changes (but not part number changes) in English language AAPs such as:

- 2. T. → pt. 2
- 3o libro → bk. 3
- 4. livre → bk. 4

We agree with the WG that additional examples need to be considered for this sub-instruction.

Option 1

- Adds guidance for selecting whether to record the numbers in cardinal or ordinal form.

- Adds a sentence about recording the caption in the language preferred by the agency creating the data.
- Makes a single reference to Appendix B.5.4.
- Retains the current wording for the if/then paragraph.
- Concurs with the WG's deletion of explanatory information in the first example box.
- Suggests explanation text for the Italian language examples.

Marked-up copy (from the current RDA instructions)

6.16.1.3.1 Serial Number

Record the serial number or numbers of a musical work. Record the number in cardinal or ordinal form based on how the work is commonly identified either through use in resources embodying the work or in reference sources.

Record the caption in a language preferred by the agency creating the data. Use abbreviations as instructed in appendix B (B.5.4). If a serial number has no caption associated with it, record the number as a numeral and precede it with the abbreviation for *number*.

~~If works with the same title and the same medium of performance are consecutively numbered in music reference sources, record the number.~~

EXAMPLE

no. 2

~~Resource described:~~ String quartet no. 2 / Eleanor Cory. ~~Preferred title:~~ Quartets; ~~medium of performance:~~ violins (2), viola, cello

no. 5

~~Resource described:~~ Fifth symphony for orchestra / by Arnold Bax. ~~Preferred title:~~ Symphonies; ~~medium of performance:~~ orchestra

no. 6-8

~~Resource described:~~ Violin sonatas op. 30 nos. 1-3 / Beethoven. ~~Preferred title:~~ Sonatas; ~~medium of performance:~~ violin, piano; ~~opus number:~~ op. 30. ~~Beethoven's violin sonatas no. 6-8 also known as his opus 30, no. 1-3~~

if:

different works in a consecutively numbered series have different forms of numeric designation, or different words introducing the number

and

the different forms or words are in the same sources from which the numeric designations for the individual works are taken

then:

select one form of numeric designation and use it for all the works in the series.

EXAMPLE

1st ~~book~~ bk.

~~Resource described:~~ The first set of songs : in four parts / composed by John Dowland ; scored from the first edition, printed in the year 1597, and preceded by a life of the composer by W. Chappell

2nd ~~book~~ bk.

~~Resource described:~~ Second book of songs (1600) / John Dowland ; edited by Edmund H. Fellows ; revised by Thurston Dart

1o libro

Resource described: Il primo libro de ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci / di Claudio Merulo da Correggio.
Italian caption recorded based on the preference of the cataloguing agency
3o libro

Resource described: Ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci : libro terzo / di Claudio Merulo.
Italian caption recorded based on the preference of the cataloguing agency

Option 1

Clean copy

6.16.1.3.1 Serial Number

Record the serial number or numbers of a musical work. Record the number in cardinal or ordinal form based on how the work is commonly identified either through use in resources embodying the work or in reference sources.

Record the caption in a language preferred by the agency creating the data. Use abbreviations as instructed in appendix B (B.5.4). If a serial number has no caption associated with it, record the number as a numeral and precede it with the abbreviation for *number*.

EXAMPLE

no. 2

Resource described: String quartet no. 2 / Eleanor Cory

no. 5

Resource described: Fifth symphony for orchestra / by Arnold Bax

no. 6-8

Resource described: Violin sonatas op. 30 nos. 1-3 / Beethoven

If:

different works in a consecutively numbered series have different forms of numeric designation, or different words introducing the number

and

the different forms or words are in the same sources from which the numeric designations for the individual works are taken

then:

select one form of numeric designation and use it for all the works in the series.

EXAMPLE

1st bk.

Resource described: The first set of songs : in four parts / composed by John Dowland ; scored from the first edition, printed in the year 1597, and preceded by a life of the composer by W. Chappell

2nd bk.

Resource described: Second book of songs (1600) / John Dowland ; edited by Edmund H. Fellows ; revised by Thurston Dart

1o libro

Resource described: Il primo libro de ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci / di Claudio Merulo da Correggio.
Italian caption recorded based on the preference of the cataloguing agency

3o libro

Resource described: Ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci : libro terzo / di Claudio Merulo.
Italian caption recorded based on the preference of the cataloguing agency

Option 2

- Adds a sentence to record the number as a numeral.
- Includes a paragraph about recording the caption in a language preferred by the agency creating the data.
- Makes a single reference to Appendix B.5.4.
- Contains a single merged example box, with all but one of the existing examples, updated to match the instructions. (Additional or replacement examples would certainly be appropriate.)

Clean copy (completely replaces current instruction – no markup provided)

6.16.1.3.1 Serial Number

Record the serial number or numbers of a musical work. Record the number as a numeral.

Record the caption in a language preferred by the agency creating the data. Use abbreviations as instructed in appendix B ([B.5.4](#)). If a serial number has no caption associated with it, record the number as a numeral and precede it with the abbreviation for *number*.

EXAMPLE

no. 2

Resource described: String quartet no. 2 / Eleanor Cory.

no. 5

Resource described: Fifth symphony for orchestra / by Arnold Bax.

bk. 1

Resource described: The first set of songs : in four parts / composed by John Dowland ; scored from the first edition, printed in the year 1597, and preceded by a life of the composer by W. Chappell

bk. 2

Resource described: Second book of songs (1600) / John Dowland ; edited by Edmund H. Fellows ; revised by Thurston Dart

bk. 1

Resource described: Il primo libro de ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci / di Claudio Merulo da Correggio. **Italian caption recorded based on the preference of the cataloguing agency**

bk. 3

Resource described: Ricercari da cantare : a quattro voci : libro terzo / di Claudio Merulo. **Italian caption recorded based on the preference of the cataloguing agency**

Change #3.5 – 6.16.1.3.2

If the JSC agrees with the ALA approach described above, related changes need to be made to 6.16.1.3.2, *Opus Number*. We recommend:

- Allowing for recording multiple opus numbers.
- Specifying recording the number as a numeral.
- Referencing B.5.4 for the abbreviation “op.”
- Removing the terminology “if any” from the first sentence, since this instruction is already only applied if such a number is readily ascertainable.
- Referencing 6.16.1.3.1 for how to record a number within an opus.

- Modifying the if/then paragraph to incorporate the separate paragraph “Add the publisher’s name in parentheses” into the then clause.
- Removing the example explanations in the 1st example box to reflect the similar recommendation in 6.16.1.3.1.

Marked-up copy

6.16.1.3.2 Opus Number

Record the opus number or numbers. ~~, if any, and~~ Record the number as a numeral and precede it with the abbreviation for *opus* (see appendix B (B.5.4)). Record the number within the opus, if any, ~~by applying the instructions at 6.16.1.3.1.~~

EXAMPLE

op. 114

Resource described: Quintett in A für Klavier, Violine, Viola, Violoncello und Kontrabass D 667 (op. post. 114) : Forellen-Quintett = Quintet in A major for piano, violin, viola, violoncello, and double bass : the trout quintet / Franz Schubert ; herausgegeben von Arnold Feil. ~~**Preferred title:** Quintets; **medium of performance:** piano, violin, viola, violoncello, double bass~~

op. 2, no. 1

~~**Resource described:** Piano sonata no. 1 in F minor, op. 2, no. 1 / Beethoven. **Preferred title:** Sonatas; **medium of performance:** piano; **serial number:** no. 1~~

op. 2, no. 2

~~**Resource described:** Piano sonata no. 2 in A major, op. 2, no. 2 / Beethoven. **Preferred title:** Sonatas; **medium of performance:** piano; **serial number:** no. 2~~

If:

there is a conflict in opus numbering among works of the same title and medium

or

the overall opus numbering of a composer’s works is confused and conflicting

then:

add to the opus number the name of the publisher originally using the number chosen. Add the publisher's name in parentheses.

EXAMPLE

op. 6 (Roger)

Preferred title for work by Robert Valentine: Sonatas; **medium of performance:** recorder, continuo. **Published originally by Roger as op. 6; later published as op. 5**

op. 6 (Walsh)

Preferred title for work by Robert Valentine: Sonatas; **medium of performance:** recorders (2). **Published originally by Walsh as op. 6; Walsh used a different opus number from Roger**

Clean copy

6.16.1.3.2 Opus Number

Record the opus number or numbers. Record the number as a numeral and precede it with the abbreviation for *opus* (see appendix B (B.5.4)). Record the number within the opus, if any, by applying the instructions at 6.16.1.3.1.

EXAMPLE

op. 114

Resource described: Quintett in A für Klavier, Violine, Viola, Violoncello und Kontrabass D 667 (op. post. 114) : Forellen-Quintett = Quintet in A major for piano, violin, viola, violoncello, and double bass : the trout quintet / Franz Schubert ; herausgegeben von Arnold Feil

op. 2, no. 1

Resource described: Piano sonata no. 1 in F minor, op. 2, no. 1 / Beethoven

op. 2, no. 2

Resource described: Piano sonata no. 2 in A major, op. 2, no. 2 / Beethoven

If:

there is a conflict in opus numbering among works of the same title and medium

or

the overall opus numbering of a composer's works is confused and conflicting

then:

add to the opus number the name of the publisher originally using the number chosen. Add the publisher's name in parentheses.

EXAMPLE

op. 6 (Roger)

Preferred title for work by Robert Valentine: Sonatas; **medium of performance:** recorder, continuo. **Published originally by Roger as op. 6; later published as op. 5**

op. 6 (Walsh)

Preferred title for work by Robert Valentine: Sonatas; **medium of performance:** recorders (2). **Published originally by Walsh as op. 6; Walsh used a different opus number from Roger**

Change #4 – 6.16.1.3.3

ALA recommends a more thorough revision of this sub-instruction to provide guidance about how to record the numbers. As is evident from the current examples, the form of number can include a range, and thematic index numbers may include roman numerals. Thus our revision includes a mention of “number or numbers”, to correspond with the similar changes for serial and opus numbers, and it specifies using the form of number as found in the thematic index. We agree with the WG about simplifying the example explanations.

Marked-up copy (based on current RDA instruction)

6.16.1.3.3 Thematic Index Number

Record the number or numbers assigned to a work as found in a thematic index for the composer. If the thematic index number has no caption associated with it, precede
~~In the case of certain composers, record the number assigned to a work in a recognized thematic index. Precede the number by:~~

the initial letter or letters of the musicologist's name (e.g., K. 453¹)

or

a generally accepted abbreviation (e.g., BWV 232²).

EXAMPLE

D. 667

Resource described: Quintett in A für Klavier, Violine, Viola, Violoncello und Kontrabass D 667 (op. post. 114) : Forellen-Quintett = Quintet in A major for piano, violin, viola, violoncello, and double bass : the trout quintet / Franz Schubert ; herausgegeben von Arnold Feil. ~~Preferred title: Quintets; medium of performance: piano, violin, viola, violoncello, double bass~~

H. III, 37-42

Resource described: 6 string quartets, opus 33, Hoboken III, 37-42 = 6 Streichquartette / Joseph Haydn ; edited by Simon Rowland-Jones ; editorial consultant, David Ledbetter. ~~Preferred title: Quartets; medium of performance: violins (2), viola, cello; opus number: op. 33~~

BWV 1046-1051

Resource described: Brandenburg concertos = Les concertos brandebourgeois / J.S. Bach. ~~Preferred title: Brandenburgische Konzerte~~

¹Ludwig Köchel, *Chronologisch-thematisches Verzeichnis sämtlicher Tonwerke Wolfgang Amadé Mozart s. 8., unveränderte Aufl.* (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1983, ©1964).

²Wolfgang Schmieder, *Thematisch-systematisches Verzeichnis der musikalischen Werke von Johann Sebastian Bach, Bach-Werke-Verzeichnis (BWV). 3., unveränderte Aufl.* (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel Musikverlag, 1961, ©1950).

Clean copy

6.16.1.3.3 Thematic Index Number

Record the number or numbers assigned to a work as found in a thematic index for the composer. If the thematic index number has no caption associated with it, precede the number by:

the initial letter or letters of the musicologist's name (e.g., K. 453¹)

or

a generally accepted abbreviation (e.g., BWV 232²).

EXAMPLE

D. 667

Resource described: Quintett in A für Klavier, Violine, Viola, Violoncello und Kontrabass D 667 (op. post. 114) : Forellen-Quintett = Quintet in A major for piano, violin, viola, violoncello, and double bass : the trout quintet / Franz Schubert ; herausgegeben von Arnold Feil

H. III, 37-42

Resource described: 6 string quartets, opus 33, Hoboken III, 37-42 = 6 Streichquartette / Joseph Haydn ; edited by Simon Rowland-Jones ; editorial consultant, David Ledbetter

BWV 1046-1051

Resource described: Brandenburg concertos = Les concertos brandebourgeois / J.S. Bach

¹Ludwig Köchel, *Chronologisch-thematisches Verzeichnis sämtlicher Tonwerke Wolfgang Amadé Mozart s. 8., unveränderte Aufl.* (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1983, ©1964).

²Wolfgang Schmieder, *Thematisch-systematisches Verzeichnis der musikalischen Werke von Johann Sebastian Bach, Bach-Werke-Verzeichnis (BWV). 3., unveränderte Aufl.* (Leipzig: Breitkopf & Härtel Musikverlag, 1961, ©1950).