

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Dave Reser, LC Representative
Subject: Revisions to instructions for additions to access points representing musical works with distinctive titles (6.28.1.10 and 6.28.1.10.1).

While we appreciate the thought the Music Working Group has given to this issue, we do not agree with the proposal as written. We do agree with the Music Working Group on these issues:

Issue #1: Other distinguishing characteristic and Form of Work

Response: We believe that terms like "Opera" and "Piano work" are both forms of work according to the broad definition of form of work at 6.3, so we agree that form of work would be a useful addition to break conflicts.

Issue #2: Exceptions for 6.28.1.10

Response: We agree that if neither medium of performance nor form of work can break a conflict between access points for two different musical works, another element should be used *instead* of those, rather than *in addition* to those.

Issue #5: Additions of examples at either 6.6.1.3 or 6.3.1.3.

Response: We will defer to the Examples Editor about adding an example for "Piano work" at 6.3.1.3.

During our discussion of this proposal, the following issues were raised:

1) We are concerned that retaining a priority order of additions in 6.28.1.10 may not allow agencies the flexibility they need/want since other instructions for access points in chapter 6 are less restrictive (see 6.27.1.9, 6.27.3, and 6.28.3). So, we suggest removing the "(in this order of preference)" before listing medium or performance and form of work.

2) We found the exceptions proposed for 6.28.1.10 difficult to understand. For exception "a)" we do not see the value in telling catalogers not to add an element that cannot be recorded because it seems illogical that any cataloger would add an element in an authorized access point that they could not record easily as an element. For exception "c)", while we have no problem with an agency using serial numbers to break conflicts, we think it should be an agency decision and/or cataloger judgment to do so, rather than RDA policy.

3) Since RDA was released, we have been troubled by the fact that the list of additions at 6.28.1.10.1 and the names of the elements do not match. We think these inconsistencies should be resolved now since the instruction is being changed with this proposal. There is no need to say "year of publication" in the authorized access point instructions because 6.4 allows the year of publication to be used for date of work when information about the date of the creation is not available. If the date of creation of the musical work is available, then that date should be added instead of date of publication.

4) We do not like referring from medium of performance in 6.28.1.10 to 6.28.1.9.1 since 6.28.1.9.1 contains a long list of Exceptions for when medium of performance is not added to access points for musical works that are *not distinctive*. We believe that the reference from 6.28.1.10 to 6.28.1.9.1 was only intended to cover the order of instruments, voices, etc., and not the Exceptions for adding medium of performance to the authorized access point. However, the current reference makes this ambiguous.

We have provided a mark-up version of 6.28.1.10 and 6.28.1.10.1 that takes into account these additional comments. It preserves the priority order of medium of performance and form of work over other elements since both versions of Change 1 in 6JSC/MusicWG/11 included a priority order; incorporates wording relative to the exceptions; addresses our concerns about using the RDA elements names in the instructions, and not referring to 6.28.1.9.1 for medium of performance.

We realize that some changes have been made to 6.28.1.10 and 6.28.1.10.1 as a result of 6JSC/Sec/17 (e.g., "addition vs. includes). Those changes were not available in the Toolkit when this proposal/response was written so we have used the version of those instructions that was available in the Toolkit on September 8, 2015 for these proposed changes.

Note: Since our mark-up of 6.28.1.10.1 is a complete replacement of the current text at 6.28.1.10.1, we have not shown the strike-through for that instruction.

Mark-up (August Toolkit release):

6.28.1.10 Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Distinctive Titles

Make additions to access points if needed to distinguish the access point for a work:

from one that is the same or similar but represents a different work

or

from one that represents a person, family, corporate body, or place.

Add one of the following elements, as appropriate:

a) the medium of performance (see 6.28.1.10.16-28.1.9.1 RDA)

or

b) the form of work (see 6.3) ~~another distinguishing characteristic of the work (see 6.6 RDA).~~

When adding the medium of performance or the form of work, use the same type of addition for each of the access points for different musical works with identical titles.

EXAMPLE

[examples unchanged]

If the medium of performance or form of work is not sufficient or is not available to distinguish one access point from another, add one or more of the following elements instead, as appropriate:

a) the date of work (see 6.4)

b) the place of origin of the work (see 6.5)

c) another distinguishing characteristic of the work (see 6.6)

d) a numeric designation of a musical work (see 6.16)

and/or

e) key (see 6.17).

EXAMPLE

[to be added by Examples Editor]

6.28.1.10.1 Medium of Performance

Add the medium of performance (see 6.15 RDA) as applicable, in this order:

a) voices

b) keyboard instrument if there is more than one non-keyboard instrument

c) the other instruments in score order

d) continuo.

For a work for solo instrument or instruments and accompanying ensemble, add the terms for the solo instrument or instruments followed by the term for the accompanying ensemble.

Clean Copy (August Toolkit release):

6.28.1.10 Additions to Access Points Representing Musical Works with Distinctive Titles

Make additions to access points if needed to distinguish the access point for a work:

from one that is the same or similar but represents a different work

or

from one that represents a person, family, corporate body, or place.

Add one of the following elements, as appropriate:

a) the medium of performance (see 6.28.1.10.1)

or

b) the form of work (see 6.3).

When adding the medium of performance or the form of work, use the same type of addition for each of the access points for different musical works with identical titles.

EXAMPLE

[examples unchanged]

If the medium of performance or form of work is not sufficient or is not available to distinguish one access point from another, add one or more of the following elements instead, as appropriate:

a) the date of work (see 6.4)

b) the place of origin of the work (see 6.5)

c) another distinguishing characteristic of the work (see 6.6)

d) a numeric designation of a musical work (see 6.16)

and/or

e) key (see 6.17).

EXAMPLE

[to be added by Examples Editor]

6.28.1.10.1 Medium of Performance

Add the medium of performance (see 6.15 **RDA**) as applicable, in this order:

a) voices

b) keyboard instrument if there is more than one non-keyboard instrument

c) the other instruments in score order

d) continuo.

For a work for solo instrument or instruments and accompanying ensemble, add the terms for the solo instrument or instruments followed by the term for the accompanying ensemble.