

To: Joint Steering Committee for Development of RDA
From: Kathy Glennan, ALA Representative
Subject: Revision of instruction language for Part of a Larger Part (6.14.2.7.1.5)

ALA thanks the JSC Music Working Group for this proposal to clarify the instructions for determining the preferred title for part of a larger part of a musical work. The majority of the ALA respondents agree with the overall concepts articulated in the proposal, although several questioned why music cannot be addressed by the general instructions in 6.2.2.9.

Our response consists of two parts:

- rewording suggestions for parts of the Working Group’s revisions, if the JSC prefers this solution
- an alternative approach to solving the problem, which ALA prefers

Rewording suggestions – JSC Music Working Group’s proposed text

ALA agrees with all of the deletions suggested by the Working Group, as well as the changes proposed to the examples.

We offer the following rewording suggestions to improve clarity:

- Several ALA members have questioned the use of the word “part” three times within seven words (see the “if” clause, 1st paragraph). Thus, we recommend replacing “the part is part of a larger part...” with “the part is a component of a larger part” to lessen the repetition and potential confusion by different uses of the term “part” in such close proximity. This affects the first and second if/then paragraphs.
- In the first if/then paragraph, the larger part has a distinctive title. Thus, the “then” clause only needs to reference the title of the larger work. Likewise, the final sentence should not include “and/or designation”.
- In the second if/then paragraph, we do not believe the phrase “omitting the title of the larger part” is needed in the “then” clause, since “only” is already part of the clause.
- In the exception, the larger part does not have a distinctive title. Thus, the final sentence should not include “title and/or”.

Our recommendations result in the following (*clean copy only, based on the Working Group’s proposal*):

6.14.2.7.1.5 Part of a Larger Part

If:

the part is a component of a larger part of a musical work

and

the larger part has a distinctive title

then:

record the title of the larger part followed by the title and/or designation of the smaller part. Separate the title of the larger part from the title and/or designation of the smaller part by a full stop.

EXAMPLE

Cantiones sacrae. O vos omnes

Preferred title for a part of Hieronymus Praetorius's *Opus musicum*

If:

the part is a component of a larger part of a musical work

and

the larger part has a title and/or designation that is not distinctive

then:

record only the title and/or designation of the smaller part.

EXAMPLE

Pifa

not Part 1. Pifa

Preferred title for a part of George Frideric Handel's *Messiah*

Exception

If the designation of the larger part is required to identify the smaller part, record the designation of the larger part followed by the title and/or designation of the smaller part. Separate the designation of the larger part from the title and/or designation of the smaller part by a full stop.

EXAMPLE

Atto 3o. Preludio

Preferred title for a part of Giuseppe Verdi's *La traviata*

Alternative approach – complete replacement of 6.14.2.7.1.5

ALA commenters observed that the proposed revision created an almost circular decision tree:

1. Does the larger part have a distinctive title?
 - a. If so, include it in the preferred title.
2. Does the larger part have a title that is not distinctive?
 - a. Omit it.
 - b. Exception: include it if needed to identify the smaller part.
(Note: this gives the same result as in 1.a above.)

To simplify the instruction, ALA recommends replacing the existing text entirely. Our rewrite:

- Uses “the part is a component of a larger part” instead of “the part is part of a larger part” for the reasons mentioned above
- Uses “title, etc.” when possible, to reduce the repetition of “title and/or other verbal designation”
- Has one basic instruction (record the title, etc. of the larger part) and one exception (do not record the title, etc. of the larger part)

Clean copy – to completely replace the current 6.14.2.7.1.5

6.14.2.7.1.5 Part of a Larger Part

If the part is a component of a larger part of a musical work, record the title and/or other verbal designation of the larger part followed by the title and/or other designation of the smaller part. Separate the title, etc. of the larger part from the title, etc. of the smaller part by a full stop.

EXAMPLE

Cantiones sacrae. O vos omnes

Preferred title for a part of Hieronymus Praetorius's *Opus musicum*

Atto 3o. Preludio

Preferred title for a part of Giuseppe Verdi's *La traviata*

Exception

If:

the title and/or other verbal designation of the larger part is not distinctive

and

the title, etc. of the larger part is not required to identify the smaller part

then:

omit the title, etc. of the larger part from the preferred title of the smaller part.

EXAMPLE

Pifa

not Part 1. Pifa

Preferred title for a part of George Frideric Handel's *Messiah*